



University Budget Committee Meeting Minutes

Date: Friday, May 19, 2022

Location: via Zoom

Members Present: Voting members present: CFO & VP Jeff Wilson, Co-Chair, and Provost & VP Jennifer Summit, Co-Chair, VP Jeff Jackanicz, VP Jamillah Moore, VP Jason Porth, Dean Eugene Sivadas, Jennifer Daly, Mary Menees, Dylan Mooney, Evrim Ozer, Renee Stephens, Joshua Ochoa, Nancy Gerber, Akm Newaz, Gitanjali Shahani, Genie Stowers, Senate Chair Teddy Albinak, SIC Chair Michael Goldman, ASCSU FGA Liaison Darlene Yee-Melichar
Non-voting members present: President Lynn Mahoney, Elena Stoian, Dwayne Banks, Katie Lynch, Cesar Mozo, Sandee Noda, Mirel Tikkanen, Venesia Thompson-Ramsey, Tammie Ridgell, Jamil Sheared, Deborah Elia.

Members Absent: AS VP of Finance, Nia Hall, Jaime Haymond, James Martel, Lark Winner, UAPD rep

Committee Staff Present: Liesl Violante, Edwin Critchlow

Guests Present: (list of all guests furnished upon request)

Accompanying presentation to view concurrently can be found here: [UBC Presentation May 19, 2022](#)

~~~~~  
UBC co-chairs called this meeting to order at approximately 10:03 A.M.

### **Agenda topic # 1 – Welcome from Co-Chairs**

- **Jennifer Summit** and **Jeff Wilson** welcomed committee members and guests..
- Guests were reminded of the ways to contact UBC and upcoming Office Hours.
- Agenda was approved.

### **Agenda topic # 2 – Member roll call and membership change**

- Noted absent members: Nia Hall, Jaime Haymond, Lynn Mahoney, James Martel, Joshua Ochoa, Jamil Sheared, Lark Winner

### **Agenda topic # 3 – Approval of minutes from April 22, 2022 meeting**

- **Jennifer Summit** requested approval of meeting minutes. Minutes approved as corrected.

### **Agenda topic # 4 – President’s Message**

- Lynn Mahoney acknowledged and thanked the engaged community of UBC members.
- Governor's budget includes an additional \$200 million for recurring funds for the CSU but short of the \$600 million the Senate was suggesting for the CSU. As a result, advocacy efforts have intensified. James Martell, sandy Noda, and President Mahoney sent a joint letter to a local assembly Member, who is head of the Budget Committee for the Assembly, and to the head of the Senate, and to the Budget Committee as well expressing the need for funding for salary increase for our employees. Advocacy at the state level will increase as well. Please join us by sending the templates shared in the chat to your Assembly members and Senators.
- There is confidence with shared state-wide advocacy of academic senate, unions, and student associations that there will be an increase to the \$200 million in funding.

- Most if not all of the funding received will go to employee compensation.
- A few CSU's in the south may receive enrollment growth funding which we will not receive since we are not near our enrollment target.
- Our numbers are down about 12.5-13% due to smaller transfer classes which is a shared challenge across the state. Retention losses among juniors and seniors most likely due to the pandemic will have a 4-6-year impact on our numbers and will take years to build back up. Pre-pandemic the retention rate was struggling so there is work to do.
- For context, local enrollment numbers published by City College have declined over the last 10 years from 73,000 to 25,000. San Mateo Community College District has reduced from 47,000 to 27,000. San Francisco Unified is down 5% this year alone. That's 2600 students. Their enrollment is down below 49,000 for the first time in decades.
- Across the state enrollment is down about 1.8%.
- Getting our numbers to 5% of our target is the goal to work toward.
- Considering now how to be a smaller university and relying on non-local students is a challenge due to housing cost here. We will be receiving \$116 million dollars for a new residential hall with 750 beds, but we do not have the capacity to become a residential college. Residential colleges are expensive especially for low income students with financial aid.
- Good news: while San Francisco unified is down 5% in the last year we actually enrolled more students from San Francisco unified.
- All efforts toward stabilizing and growing our enrollment by recruiting students and more importantly, retaining them will be done in the following ways:
  - Work extremely intentionally to make sure that we're providing the kind of holistic experience for students, that even local students want to come here.
  - More intentional outreach to our local high schools. Conversations with Dr. Wayne, the incoming Superintendent for SFUSD who has a lot of experience in the East Bay building partnerships.
  - Will be having conversations with Chancellor Martin from CCSF and his colleagues on campus this summer.
- Energize all efforts to continuously communicate with your local elected officials this year.
- President Mahoney acknowledged the great work and positive collaboration of the UBC over the pandemic to continue virtually under the leadership of CFO Jeff Wilson and Provost Jennifer Summit, with a special thanks to Provost Summit for her leadership as she transitions the co-chair position to Provost Sueyoshi in the fall.
- **Genie Stowers:** Why the funding for the dorm might not have been included in the May revise?
- **Lynn Mahoney:** The funding was from a different program from last year and already allocated. We expect to receive it and will still lobby for other renovations, but receiving \$116 million
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar:** Encouraged faculty, staff, students, and administrators it would be beneficial to reach out to individual legislators in our local area from her understanding from a fiscal and governmental affairs committee that she attend yesterday where they indicated that the governor himself said that he would not lift the pen to allocate for the funds but he could be persuaded by the legislature. She also asked which specific individuals would be recommended to reach out to?
- **Lynn Mahoney:** recommended reaching out to elected officials from your area and Nancy Skinner the head of the Budget Committee (from the chat: Anthony Rendon, chair of the committee)
- President Mahoney will be meeting with an elected official on campus for employee compensations which is the top priority right now.
- **S. Evrim Ozer:** Is San Francisco Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development able to offer any type of vouchers to our students especially students with children? We have one of the best early childhood education centers in San Francisco, that alone makes us special destination campus.

- **Lynn Mahoney:** Student Affairs has a housing coordinator that can help students who are housing insecure. There are urban programs that students can go to as well. The Mayor was thrilled about the plan to build out student housing to reduce pressure on apartments in the area.

### Agenda topic # 5 – Athletics' Budget/Finances Presentation

*(see slides 9-15)*

*Presented by Stephanie Shrieve-Hawkins*

- **Genie Stowers:** Was the deficit on slide 11 due to lower enrollment?
- **Stephanie Shrieve-Hawkins:** Summer of 2021 we could not renew the assistant coach contracts which were funded from the general fund and not able to gain it back, so we needed to use some of our fee money from the year before that we saved in travel to bring back the assistant coaches this year.
- **Genie Stowers:** mentioned it seems like a lot of money for assistant coaches and were there other factor as well?
- **Stephanie Shrieve-Hawkins:** benefits are included as well.
- **Genie Stowers:** stated that almost one million dollars and 20% of the budget seemed like a lot for just assistant coaches.
- **Genie Stowers:** what are the MPP positions?
- **Stephanie Shrieve-Hawkins:** myself, senior associate athletic director, and budget manager (with that salary paid by other sources as well).
- **Genie Stowers:** thanked Stephanie for presenting on the Athletics Department.
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar:** On slide 10 the IRA athletics fee is \$58 per semester. How does that compare with other campuses?
- **Stephanie Shrieve-Hawkins:** Within CSU it varies such as some of the athletic departments, have a student success fee, which we do not. San Marcos, for example, has an athletics fee that is paid and they don't receive IRA money and so there's about three of us who do receive that IRA fee. Some campuses are division I and some have a built-in increase, which we did until 2021 when it was capped. So each campus differs. The comparison slides can be shared if requested.
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar:** Will other campuses be raising their IRA athletics fees in the coming year?
- **Stephanie Shrieve-Hawkins:** A few have talked about it, and the athletic directors are pushing for that, but I don't know the percentage. Chico is looking for renewing their referendum. Some are just asking for a 2% increase to have built into cost of living. More information can be shared if requested.
- **S. Evrim Ozer:** Can you share any trends related to the cost of aging facilities in the GYM? Is GYM upkeep part of Athletics expenses?
- **Stephanie Shrieve-Hawkins:** It's a shared cost, as you know, with the kinesiology and then REC sports left the building a while ago but still rent out some of the spaces there. I was just on the Capital Planning Committee meeting yesterday, and I'll be moving forward with some proposals in particularly the locker rooms and some of the other spaces in there because there is a lot of space that can be explored and reevaluated to benefit the entire campus. Some space could hold a classroom and be structured better.

### Agenda topic # 6 –Enrollment Update

*(see slides 17-24)*

*Presented by Katie Lynch, Sutee Sujitparapitaya, Lori Beth Way*

- **Michael Goldman:** Where are we on graduation rates and the effort to increase those to show students they can graduate in less time and pay less money on campus?

- **Lori Beth Way:** Graduation rates were steadily getting better until the last year, as we expected, we usually look at those rates in October, and we will give a full report then. Some student goals are 4-6 years and some return in year 7-8 if one or two more classes are needed. It is something we are working toward.
- **Teddy Albiniaak:** Acknowledged the hard work and thanked the enrollment team for the presentation and updating the committee on all the ways they are working to stabilize the downward trend with short term direct engagement and long-term relationship building strategies.
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar:** Has there been any discussion about how San Francisco State University's campus might work with other campuses in the CSU system to direct students they can not accommodate?
- **Lori Beth Way:** mentioned redirects are more effective than they used to be but based on how students rank where they want to attend. The next batch of redirects should arrive next week.
- **Gretchen LeBuhn:** Asked if there are matching declines in Bay Area high schools and do we track those declines in order to do outreach to those districts?
- **Katie Lynch:** We are constantly reviewing the data from applications to enrollment and which high schools and community colleges to target with the limited recruitment resources for the most yield based on past efforts. Just recently with VP Moore's leadership we signed a memo of understanding between San Mateo Community College District and Sequoia Unified School District and working on doing similar things with San Francisco Unified. Other parts of the state which have growth in enrollments are strategically targeted by our recruitment efforts.
- **Gretchen LeBuhn:** Does the decline in applicants and enrollments at SF State match the declines in enrollment of graduating seniors?
- **Katie Lynch:** Yes
- **Nancy Gerber:** Has there been any discussion about moving to a 12-week summer session? And is there a strategy for trying to increase the number of offerings? I know many of the students in the college of science and engineering, would like to take more classes in the summer, but especially in the upper division the offerings are relatively slim.
- **Lori Beth Way:** mentioned the Academic Senate passed a policy creating a scheduling committee and hopes to take a discussion to them about summer this year. Funding has increased to colleges for summer offerings and also the FTE target. This idea can be worked on to hone offerings for summer.

#### **Agenda topic # 7 – IDC Workgroup Update**

*(see slides 26-53)*

***Presented by Eugene Sivadas , Jennifer Daly, Dwayne Banks, Elena Stoian, and Michael Goldman***

- **Nancy Gerber** suggested for the sake of time to just give recommendations and present information once. Also, what is the ask from UBC and could we start with that in order to give clear feedback?
- **Jennifer Summit** responded that this is an information item and not an action item. Recommendations will come back to the UBC Steering Committee and then worked through to then be brought to actionable recommendations.

#### **Agenda topic # 8 – FY 22-23 Campus Budget Planning Status**

*(see slides 54-61)*

***Presented by Elena Stoian***

- **Nancy Gerber** mentioned her concern about the presentation heavy meetings and suggested the committee think about how to be used to make budgetary decisions. She also thanked the committee for allowing her to serve as this is the end of her term.

### Agenda topic # 9 – Public Forum

- **Jennifer Summit** opened the public forum.
- **Katie Murphy** shared the work for the voter voice campaign to encourage everyone to contact their legislators to fund the CSU beyond what was in the May revise. Contact Sandy Noda for postcards to send.
- **Genie Stowers** requested more information on the athletics deficit breakdown.
- **Elena Stoian** clarified most of the deficit was due to the pandemic period when fee revenue was not available and they still had operating expenses to move forward even though their operations were smaller. Now they are bringing their operations back to campus. Also, low enrollment is affecting them again. There is enough resources for this year, but there is a multi-year plan for post-funding.
- **Genie Stowers** asked who is covering the deficit this year.
- **Elena Stoian** responded they have available funds.
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar** asked how the state appropriations limit and the unaddressed \$3.4 billion will affect the CSU system
- **Elena Stoian** responded the only way we can address this may most likely be through the one-time funding.
- Thanks, and appreciation was given to Provost Summit by **Mary Menees**
- **Akm Newaz** asked about any budget predictions for the future since the economy and stock market are not doing well.
- **Elena Stoian** mentioned that we would be fully funded for compensations by the request the board of trustees would submit to the Governor.
- **Genie Stowers** asked of Lori Beth and Katie Lynch how much longer do we have to spend HEERF funds and is that a strategy that we will be able to use again if there is still money left.
- **Katie Lynch** explained there were automatic grant extensions from the federal government on HEERF funds and the institutional funds we will have until 2023 but they will be used sooner but there may be particular parameters in place for using these funds.
- **Jeff Wilson** mentioned there was an extension until June of 2023, but those funds are committed to be spent based on last year's exercise for allocation of those funds. The direction is not to let them languish until June of 2023 unless absolutely necessary.

### Co-Chairs adjourned the meeting approximately 11:59 AM

- Next meeting: Thursday, August 25, 2022 from 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM via Zoom

-end (lv)

## **FROM THE CHAT:**

- From Member - Teddy Albiniak (he/him/his) to Everyone 10:00 AM
- Good morning all
- From Avi (Chandiramani) Advani to Everyone 10:00 AM
- Good morning everyone!
- From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone 10:01 AM
- Good morning!!
- From Jennifer Summit (she/her/hers) to Everyone 10:01 AM
- Good morning and welcome, everyone! people are still joining us, so we'll start in just a minute or two
- From Alex Hwu (he/him/his) to Everyone 10:03 AM
- Morning
- From Member, Mary Menees to Everyone 10:04 AM
- Thank You, Provost Summit!!
- From member, renee e. stephens to Everyone 10:04 AM
- Thank you VP Summit!
- From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone 10:04 AM
- Thank you!!
- From Member, Akm Newaz to Everyone 10:05 AM
- Thank you VP Summit!
- From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) to Everyone 10:05 AM
- Thanks for your leadership, Jennifer, in helping us all move UBC move to a more meaningful role for the campus!
- From Me to Everyone 10:06 AM
- STAFF OFFICE HOURS
- Time: May 20, 2022 10:00 AM Pacific Time (US and Canada)
- Join Zoom Meeting
- <https://sfsu.zoom.us/j/82938261859?pwd=MTlhSFNITThlVnJXeVpiUlJPRjIwUTog>
- Meeting ID: 829 3826 1859
- Passcode: 868931
- FACULTY MPP OFFICE HOURS
- Time: May 20, 2022 10:00 AM Pacific Time (US and Canada)
- Join Zoom Meeting
- <https://sfsu.zoom.us/j/86797264411?pwd=b3dMOEGHODcoMnpXTnhWaUMvbGtOZzog>
- 
- Meeting ID: 867 9726 4411
- Passcode: 804055
- From Alex Hwu (he/him/his) to Everyone 10:09 AM
- Provost Summit, thank you for all the leadership
- From Jamillah Moore to Everyone 10:09 AM
- Thank you for your leadership, VP Summit!
- From Me to Everyone 10:12 AM
- Budget Advocacy Materials - <https://sfsu.box.com/s/71d9bqxwptvgn2h83c2pzlh8a10ycjc>
- From Katie Murphy to Everyone 10:12 AM
- The CSUEU is running an email campaign that anyone in the State of California can use to urge their elected officials to increase funding: <https://www.csueu.org/take-action?vvsrc=%2fcampaigns%2f93774%2frespond>
- From Jennifer Summit (she/her/hers) to Everyone 10:12 AM
- thank you, Liesl
- From Joshua Rudy Ochoa to Everyone 10:15 AM
- For community colleges, are those FTE or total numbers of students?
- From Katie Lynch (she/her/hers) to Everyone 10:17 AM

- @Joshua- headcount
- From Joshua Rudy Ochoa to Everyone 10:18 AM
- 🙄
- From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone 10:20 AM
- Thanks, VP's Summit & Wilson!!
- Thank you, Pres. Mahoney.
- From S. Evrim Ozer (they/them/theirs) to Everyone 10:23 AM
- Is San Francisco Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development able to offer any type of vouchers to our students especially students with children? We have one of the best early childhood education centers in San Francisco, that alone makes us special destination campus.
- From Sandee Noda to Everyone 10:25 AM
- Nancy Skinner
- Anthony Rendon The chair of the Assembly
- From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) to Everyone 10:25 AM
- Nancy Skinner is State Senator for parts of the East Bay, for those who live there!
- From Sandee Noda to Everyone 10:28 AM
- Katie will mention about the Unions campaign but I want to make sure that all of you do our voter voice -including ALL Administrators, Faculty, Students
- From S. Evrim Ozer (they/them/theirs) to Everyone 10:36 AM
- Can you share any trends related to the cost of aging facilities in the GYM? Is GYM upkeep part of Athletics expenses?
- From Jerry Shapiro to Everyone 10:36 AM
- Required NCAA compliance?
- From Eugene Sivadas to Everyone 10:37 AM
- Some CSUs are Division 1
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 10:39 AM
- The College of Health & Social Sciences covers the majority of expenses for upkeep in the gym - which has been a cause for concern given the shared nature of the space.
- From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone 10:40 AM
- s it possible to add \$\$ to positions on slide 14?
- From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone 10:41 AM
- Sorry, first word is "is"
- From Stephanie Shrieve-Hawkins to Everyone 10:43 AM
- Yes, Michael .. we can do that.
- Thanks, Dylan. Athletics also pays for some of the expenses as well. We can definitely visit about this. Want to make sure it is equitable.
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 10:44 AM
- Thanks!
- From Jennifer Summit (she/her/hers) to Everyone 10:52 AM
- The incoming student enrollments efforts have been remarkable—it's great to see that all that work has made a difference
- From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone 10:52 AM
- ^^^^
- From Lori Beth Way to Everyone 10:53 AM
- We even hosted an Ask Me Anything session last night at 7 PM for those students who haven't yet told us they're coming (AAOed).
- From Jennifer Summit (she/her/hers) to Everyone 10:53 AM
- wow--amazing work!
- From Member - Teddy Albinak (he/him/his) to Everyone 10:57 AM
- <https://summersession.sfsu.edu/>
- From S. Evrim Ozer (they/them/theirs) to Everyone 11:00 AM

- Might you comment on how much of our declining enrollment is attributable to new student enrollment versus retention?
- From Jamillah Moore to Everyone 11:00 AM
- Thank you! Great work on enrollment.
- From Member, Nancy Gerber to Everyone 11:01 AM
- Thank you for the reports. Helps us get context to budget issues.
- From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) to Everyone 11:01 AM
- such great collaboration-- thanks for those creative strategies and great examples of working together!
- From Lori Beth Way to Everyone 11:03 AM
- Thanks Teddy!
- From Katie Lynch (she/her/hers) to Everyone 11:03 AM
- @Evrin, incoming student has been the bigger hit to overall enrollment over time. However, improving retention will help us balance the challenges we are seeing with enrollment.
- From Carmen Domingo to Everyone 11:14 AM
- The %IDC varies by agency
- From Michael Scott to Everyone 11:23 AM
- Please note: Student benefits are VERY low since they don't get health insurance or pension. They do have to pay social security and Medicare like any normal person.
- IDC is general fund. It can be used just like any other University account. There are no special restrictions since IDC is a reimbursement to the University.
- The policy was changed 6 years ago
- From Member, Nancy Gerber to Everyone 11:28 AM
- Could we please mute those not speaking?
- From Michael Scott to Everyone 11:29 AM
- ORSP is stateside everywhere. It's post award that is moved in the foundation
- From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone 11:31 AM
- Thank you, @Eugene!
- From Eugene Sivadas to Everyone 11:42 AM
- The charge was given to us by the UBC to see about allocation model. And second was about budgetary literacy and third about transparency. The slides show the budgetary literacy part and various issues related to IDC. Our recommendations are to various constituents to show a way to increase transparency and sort various issues with IDC. The recommendations for other workgroups are to recommend exploration of other issues that came up
- Regarding repetitive slides, Michael Scott may have confused the audience last time regarding the financial figures. In fact not so, they were official figures from the financial system, so we were clarifying that as well.
- From Member, Nancy Gerber to Everyone 11:42 AM
- The financial figures weren't the problem.
- In my opinion.
- From Eugene Sivadas to Everyone 11:43 AM
- Perhaps not to you. We get feedback from office hours and elsewhere
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 11:46 AM
- Thank you, Elena! Always great to have your presentations here!
- From Mary Menees to Everyone 11:46 AM
- Agreed - thank you Elena!
- From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) to Everyone 11:47 AM
- Think we have to get information to understand issues like athletics or IDCs before we can adopt recommendations-- everyone has to understand the issues.
- From Katie Murphy to Everyone 11:48 AM
- If you don't time to write a letter, please do our Voter Voice (this one goes to your local legislators!)  
<https://www.csueu.org/take-action?vvsrc=%2fcampaigns%2f93774%2frespond> At the website below (scroll to close to the bottom), we also want to make sure that Anthony Rendon, the Chair of the Assembly, hears from people outside of

his district: <https://www.csueu.org/advocacy> We are also collecting postcards to deliver to the Assembly. To get a postcard, email Sandee Noda (smnoda@gmail.com) with your office location, and she will send it to you through campus mail. Double your impact by doing Voter Voice and a postcard.

- From S. Evrim Ozer (they/them/theirs) to Everyone 11:48 AM
- Yes, I did it. Also, family members can join the advocacy as well. Thank you, Katie.
- From Mary Menees to Everyone 11:48 AM
- it's so easy to email your reps - I've done it in a few minutes.
- From Lori Beth Way to Everyone 11:49 AM
- Thank you CSUEU for making it so easy on us to do this!
- From Guest Rick Harvey to Everyone 11:52 AM
- The questions I have may be technical in nature, relating budgeting formulas. For example, I'm trying to understand how formulas are used related to faculty assignment by department (e.g. formulas such as total support fraction = teaching time, instruction administration time, other support fraction) and, the marginal cost of instruction factor per FTES (e.g. formulas such as funding per FTES of around \$15,427, minus campus net tuition revenue)?
- From Member - Teddy Albiniak (he/him/his) to Everyone 11:54 AM
- me too, but thanks Elana
- \*Elena
- From Me to Everyone 11:55 AM
- Please email [ubc@sfsu.edu](mailto:ubc@sfsu.edu) with any additional questions or concerns to be taken to the Steering Committee and workgroups.
- STAFF OFFICE HOURS Time: May 20, 2022 10:00 AM Pacific Time (US and Canada) Join Zoom Meeting  
<https://sfsu.zoom.us/j/82938261859?pwd=MTlhSFNITThlVnJXeVpiUIJPRjIwUT09> Meeting ID: 829 3826 1859 Passcode: 868931 -----
- FACULTY MPP OFFICE HOURS Time: May 20, 2022 10:00 AM Pacific Time (US and Canada) Join Zoom Meeting  
<https://sfsu.zoom.us/j/86797264411?pwd=b3dMOEgHODcoMnpXTnhWaUMvbGtOZz09>
- Meeting ID: 867 9726 4411
- Passcode: 804055
- From Member, Darlene Yee-Melichar to Everyone 11:58 AM
- CSU Staff Salary Study report available here FYI: <https://www.calstate.edu/impact-of-the-csu/government/Advocacy-and-State-Relations/legislativereports1/Salary-Study-Legislative-Report-04-29-22.pdf>