



## **University Budget Committee Meeting Minutes**

**Date:** Thursday, March 16, 2023, via Zoom

**Voting Members Present:** Amy Sueyoshi, Jeff Wilson, Jamillah Moore, Jeff Jackanicz, Jason Porth, Eugene Sivadas, Jennifer Daly, Mary Menees, Dylan Mooney, Daniel Paz Gabriner, Irving Santana, Steven Lee, Mea Montañez, Lufei Ruan, Akm Newaz, Genie Stowers, Mari Hulick, Michael Goldman, Alaric Trousdale

**Non-voting members present:** Lynn Mahoney, Elena Stoian, Dwayne Banks, Katie Lynch, Cesar Mozo, David Schachman, Venesia Thompson-Ramsey, Tammie Ridgell, Sandee Noda, Jamil Sheared, Deborah Elia, Teresa Pratt

**Guest presenters:** Cynthia Grutzik, Cathy Tong, Alvin Alvarez, Ruth Cortez

**Members Absent:** Jennifer Daly, Gretchen LeBuhn, Darlene Yee-Melichar

**Committee Staff Present:** Nancy Ganner, Mariela Esquivel

Accompanying presentation to view concurrently can be found here: [UBC Presentation March 16, 2023](#)

---

UBC co-chair Provost and VP Sueyoshi called this meeting to order at approximately 10:03 A.M.

### **Agenda topic # 1 – Welcome from Co-Chair Sueyoshi and Agenda review**

- **Amy Sueyoshi and Jeff Wilson** welcomed committee members and guests.
- Agenda reviewed and guests reminded of the ways to contact UBC, including upcoming Office Hours.

### **Agenda topic # 2 – Member roll call**

- Quorum established. Open committee seats noted.

### **Agenda topic # 3 – Approval of minutes from February 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2023 meeting**

- Minutes approved as submitted.

### **Agenda topic # 4 – President's Message**

- **Lynn Mahoney** shared gratitude for 125+ attendees, noting how moving UBC to Zoom during the pandemic allowed many to access information shared at these meetings.
- Spent time in Sacramento recently with Associated Students President and other students. They advocated not only about the cost of housing and basic needs for students, but also stressed to elected officials that student success rests on the success of CSU employees, and funding for employee compensation is critical.
- Doesn't feel optimistic about additional CSU funding request other than what's in the Governor's compact due to statewide budget deficits and effects of calamities in the banking industry. California revenues are driven by tech; anything that slows down venture capitalist funding/tech layoffs hits the State budget. If the compact holds, it's a sign of California's commitment to higher ed. The current funding is not ideal, but State revenues are declining.
- Noted recent enrollment/budget briefings offered around campus were transparent and engaging - over 1,000 campus employees attended. Questions attendees were likely thinking included "what happens next", "what happens to me" and "how will my job/curriculum change". These can't be answered in President or VP offices – it's up to everyone to work together collaboratively to get those answers. All need to rethink what SF State does and how, with flexibility and altruism to maintain the same quality and outcomes for students. Engagement is the first step in a collaborative process.

### Office Hour responses slide

- **Provost Sueyoshi** shared responses to questions raised during recent staff “UBC office hours”\_(see slide in accompanying presentation). Invited Alex Hwu, Dean of CPaGE, to respond to question about continuing credentials for the School of Nursing.
- **Alex Hwu** advised CPaGE is working closely with the School of Nursing for program development. It’s a high-demand area and there are hiring constraints. This Fall CPaGE will launch a one-year program for RN’s to become health practitioners in the California K-12 school district. Nursing is in high demand in the Bay Area and they are working to try to support nursing programs.

### Agenda topic # 5 – Budget Update

- **Jeff Wilson** and **Elena Stoian** presented budget update slides (see slides in accompanying presentation).
- **Daniel Gabriner** asked if the budget “snapshots” will be made public, and how detail might be expected.
- **Elena Stoian** explained the “snapshots” are scenario-planning at the unit levels, and available to the President and VPs to ensure the budget is on track with targets to meet reduction goals of 2024. The final results will be public to show they either met targets or didn’t.

### Agenda topic # 6 – Graduate College of Education Budget Presentation

- **Cynthia Grutzik** and **Cathy Tong** presented their slides (see slides in accompanying presentation).
- Michael Goldman asked if EdD program revenues cover program costs, and if anything comes in from the State specifically targeted towards alleviating the teacher shortage. Also asked, noting a lot of carryforward, how they might be impacted by the proposed [Carryforwards policy](#).
- **Cynthia Grutzik** replied EdD revenue does cover the cost of the program, which is a separate budget planning process whose revenue streams are kept separate from the rest of the college. They have to admit enough students to balance the cost of the program – it’s a careful calculation. They do hold some carryforwards to cover unexpected costs. As an example, in a doctoral program, they’re charged with creating a doctoral culture in a college, so funds are used to send students to conferences. Is proud that 12 of their students were accepted to make presentations at the recent Educational Research Association conference.
- To the second question, they’re involved in a few State-funded projects addressing the need for teachers. They joined the SF Urban Teacher Residency Program where students in residency get a \$20K living wage while enrolled, then immersed/embedded with a cooperating teacher at SFUSD focusing on STEM. They also partner with other districts on para-to-teacher program where the State provides funds for para-professional educators/ teacher’s aides to finish their degree in a credential at SF State. They’ve also applied for more funding for planning around integrated teaching education programs to create pathways into the credential programs to help alleviate teacher shortages – the next one is in early childhood education. They’re jumping on whatever they can in those areas to collaborate with colleagues across the systems.
- To the carryforwards question, they’re used all over the college so they’ll work with the Provost to review the impact of the proposed carryforward policy.
- **Genie Stowers** commented on the work GCOE does for accreditation requirements. As a member of three colleges in her career at SF State and an interim chair at GCOE at one point, GCOE staff has to do a lot. GCOE is the only college where faculty have a 4:4 teaching load. Even for supervisory courses, was surprised at how much they have to do, like travel all over the Bay Area to personally supervise students. Its time-consuming and requires patience and knowledge. Commended Dean Grutzik and Cathy Tong for doing an amazing job with it all.
- **Cynthia Grutzik** thanked Genie and added they also just received full accreditation from the Commission on Teacher Credentialing, and is very proud of her college teams.
- **Katie Murphy** asked if there are any plans to offer additional degree programs.

- **Cynthia Grutzik** replied there are no plans currently but they're working on a new credential for school nurses in partnership with HSS and nurses in SFUSD, thanks to Elaine Musselman's hard work. GCOE faculty are working on a new credential for pre-K through 3<sup>rd</sup> grade, connected to CHAD in HSS who is developing a new degree to match it. These developments are in response to what's needed.
- **Alesha Sohler** thanked Dean Grutzik and Cathy Tong, and also thanked Genie Stowers for chairing the department when she was there. The GCOE college team is small but they work on a lot of big things together.

#### **Work-study funds conversation posted to Chat (see Chat details at end of this document)**

- **Amy Sueyoshi** invited Katie Lynch to address the posts in the Chat re: work study funds.
- **Katie Lynch** shared a question asked last meeting she promised a follow up to: Total work-study allocation for SF State is \$1.4M and they award eligible students about \$4k in their financial aid award. Student average earnings for this year is \$1,663, and its typical for a student not to earn their full award. If they do, they can work with the financial aid office to see if it can be increased. Approx. 200 students are awarded but not all use it, so they use historical data to determine the number of students they can afford to award and stay within the budget.
- Similarly, any Federal work-study funds not used are turned into supplemental education opportunity grants awarded directly to students. They work with VP Wilson's office and Academic Resources to determine any unused funds and award that to students in the form of a grant before the end of the Federal reporting year.
- **Amy Sueyoshi** asked if she's seen any change in work-study funds, availability or utilization.
- **Katie Lynch** replied the Government hasn't changed Federal work-study allocation in a decade. Utilization shifted in the pandemic with fewer students on campus, but more students are using their work-study funds again and its expected this will continue to increase as campus returns to more activities.
- **Daniel Gabriner** asked if more funds are used, can more funds be requested.
- **Katie Lynch** replied VP Moore handles allocations to the Cabinet areas and the VPs meet over summer to review allocations. SF State requests about \$5M in Federal funds but only \$1.4M is awarded. It's never been increased as funding is distributed throughout the nation.

#### **Agenda topic # 7 – College of Health & Social Sciences Budget Presentation**

- **Alvin Alvarez** and **Ruth Cortez** presented their budget slides (see slides in accompanying presentation).
- **Daniel Gabriner** noted the operating budget is closely aligned to actuals and it's nearly the same each year, but the fund balances differ more between budget to actuals for most years. Asked about the cause and if in future years, the budget will match the actuals even closer.
- **Alvin Alvarez** replied that similar to COSE, they're a tech-heavy/equipment college and projecting equipment replacement is challenging. They're now strategically planning for the long-term. Samantha Ward identified projections of \$625K in equipment that will need replacing, and the study is not complete yet. As an example, they have an entire simulated hospital in Burk Hall where nurses are trained and 25% of their clinical hours are spent there. A labor/delivery bed costs about \$40K and the current is about 15 years old. In order to record simulations to casts it to classrooms so nursing, physical therapy and counseling students can watch others work, replacement cost is approx. \$200K and the current system is 12 years old. It's difficult to project the funding needed, then secure them, which they do by encumbering them.
- **Ruth Cortez** added operating expenses of the overall budget activities average about \$1M/year. They didn't add all the funds to the bottom and if that was shown it would be similar. The comparison is the same when it comes to actuals. They oversee funds to make sure the departments are spending within their agreements, as some funds are very restricted and can be used for only certain activities.
- **Akm Newaz** noted spending in 2021-2022 is about 3x higher in salaries/wages.
- **Ruth Cortez** replied its due to HEERF funding so additional lecturers were hired. They also provide salaries for self-support projects like Gator Camp.

- **Alvin Alvarez** explained Gator Camp is operated by Department of Kinesiology under the leadership of David Walsh, a longtime faculty member, and is entirely self-supported. Kids come to learn about different sports and its one of the longest-standing programs of its kind in the Bay Area. That also accounts for some of the elevations in salaries.

**Agenda topic # 8 – Designated Balances, Reserves and Carryforwards DRAFT Policy – 1<sup>st</sup> reading**

- (Postponed to next meeting due to lack of time)

**Agenda topic # 9 – Public Forum**

- No questions asked.

**Co-Chair adjourned the meeting approximately 12:02 PM**

- Next meeting: Thursday, April 20, 2023 from 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM via Zoom

-end (nrg)

**From the Chat:**

- 10:37:49 From Cynthia Grutzik (Guest) : EDDL is the Educational Doctorate Program Ed.D.
- 10:47:08 From Alesha Sohler (She/Her) : Thank you Cathy!
- 10:53:59 From Anarose Schelstrate : Thank you, Cathy!
- 10:54:25 From David Fierberg : Thank you, Cathy!!
- 10:55:03 From Carlos Julio : Thank you, Cathy!
- 10:56:20 From Victoria Narkewicz : Thanks Cathy. Great job 😊
- 10:56:42 From Ruth Cortez : Awesome, Cathy!
- 10:59:54 From Victoria Narkewicz : Thanks Cynthia! Great Job 😊
- 10:59:59 From Member-Michael Goldman : Does the EdD revenue cover the costs of the program? Clearly, teachers are in need in CA despite decreasing population (or am I wrong). Do any targeted state or local funds come in to help with this need? You budget a lot of carryforward money. Do you anticipate an impact from the policy we will be discussing today?
- 10:59:51 From Member, Katie Lynch (she/her/hers) : Hello all, there were questions on Federal Work Study last meeting and i promised some follow up. Here is some additional information:
- Total annual allocation: \$1,461,496
  - Average award per student awarded: \$4,000
  - # of students awarded: 2,814
  - Average earnings per student working: \$1,663 average earned to date
- 11:04:45 From Katie Murphy : Replying to "• Total annual alloc..."  
Thank you, Katie. It would be helpful to see figures from previous years (particularly pre-pandemic) to see if there has been a change in work-study availability and utilization.
- 11:00:05 From Member, Mari Hulick (she/her) : Thank you Cynthia and Cathy
- 11:03:57 From Member-Michael Goldman : Thank you!!
- 11:04:43 From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) Bay Miwok lands : Great job, Cynthia and Cathy! So open and transparent about your programs and spending-- much appreciated...
- 11:05:11 From Cynthia Grutzik (Guest) : Replying to "Great job, Cynthia a..." Thank you Genie, we appreciate it.

11:09:46 From Cynthia Grutzik (Guest) : Thank you for this comment - you are so right.

11:09:52 From Cathy Tong : Thank you Genie.

11:10:19 From Cathy Tong : Thank you all. We appreciate this opportunity!

11:12:08 From Victoria Narkewicz : Thank you Genie for mentioning the supervision and 4:4 workload for GCOE faculty!

11:16:15 From Alesha Sohler (She/Her) : Reacted to "Thank you Genie for ..." with 👍

11:39:49 From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) Bay Miwok lands : MPA students pay a fee, on top of their tuition, to cover that rent.

11:40:12 From Member, Mary Menees : Reacted to "MPA students pay a f..." with 👍

11:40:14 From Alvin Alvarez : Yes, thank you for the note Genie

11:49:21 From Member, Mari Hulick (she/her) : @ Ruth, great plug!

11:49:23 From Victoria Narkewicz : Thank you Ruth! Great Job 😊.

11:49:35 From Mirna Vasquez : Reacted to "Thank you Ruth! Gre..." with 👍

11:50:31 From Ly Chau : Reacted to "@ Ruth, great plug!" with 😊

11:52:08 From Adrian Domingo : Reacted to "@ Ruth, great plug!" with 😊

11:52:50 From Janet Remolona (she/her/goddess) : That Mentor Collective is awesome!

11:52:54 From Anarose Schelstrate : Thank you, Ruth and Alvin!

11:53:38 From Nancy Ganner : folks, we're running a little behind. We will offer a public forum if you can stay on with us.

11:55:06 From Cathy Tong : Thank you for the excellent presentation Alvin and Ruth!!

11:55:10 From Megan Hong : Thank you, Alvin and Ruth! 🍌

11:55:26 From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) Bay Miwok lands : Thanks for that great presentation, Alvin and Ruth!

11:55:32 From Christine Hintermann : Reacted to "Thanks for that grea..." with 👍

11:55:37 From Christine Hintermann : Reacted to "Thank you, Alvin and..." with 👍

11:55:39 From Member, Mari Hulick (she/her) : Thank you Alvin and Ruth!

11:55:39 From alex hwu : Well done - Ruth and Alvin

11:56:06 From Victoria Narkewicz : Thanks Dean Alvarez! Great presentation. Thanks for mentioning Innovation. Innovation drives Growth 😊

12:00:13 From Amy Sueyoshi, co-chair : To be clear CHSS is making an effort to spend down their 201 on much needed items for teaching and learning,

12:01:52 From Julie Paez : Such a great camp for kids!

12:02:59 From Member, Mari Hulick (she/her) : Thank you all. See you next month!

12:03:06 From Ingrid C. Williams (she/her/hers) : Thanks.

12:03:16 From Member Cesar A. Mozo : thank you

12:03:17 From Jeannette Peralta : Thank you

12:03:18 From Alvin Alvarez : Thank you UBC!!