



## University Budget Committee Meeting Minutes

**Date:** Thursday, November 18, 2021

**Location:** via Zoom

**Members Present:** Voting members present: CFO & VP Jeff Wilson, Co-Chair, and Provost & VP Jennifer Summit, Co-Chair, VP Jeff Jackanicz, VP Jamillah Moore, VP Jason Porth, Dean Eugene Sivadas, Jennifer Daly, Mary Menees, Dylan Mooney, Evrim Ozer, Renee Stephens, A.S. President Joshua Ochoa, Ben Kumli, Kathleen Mortier, Akm Newaz, Gitanjali Shahani, Genie Stowers, Senate Chair Teddy Albiniaik, SIC Chair Michael Goldman, ASCSU FGA Liaison Darlene Yee-Melichar. Non-voting members present: President Lynn Mahoney, Dwayne Banks, Deborah Elia, Katie Lynch, Cesar Mozo, Mirel Tikkanen, Venesia Thompson-Ramsey, Jamil Sheared.

**Members Absent:** Nia Hall, Jaime Haymond, James Martel, Sandee Noda, Tammie Ridgell, Elena Stoian, Lark Winner, UAPD rep

**Committee Staff Present:** Nancy Ganner, Edwin Critchlow (Budget Administration & Operations)

**Guests Present:** (list of all guests furnished upon request)

Accompanying presentation to read concurrently can be found here: [UBC Meeting Presentation November 18, 2021](#)

UBC co-chairs called this meeting to order at approximately 10:05 A.M.

### **Agenda topic # 1 – Welcome from Co-Chairs**

- **Jennifer Summit** and **Jeff Wilson** welcomed committee members and guests.

### **Agenda topic # 2 – member roll call**

- Noted absent members: Nia Hall, Jaime Haymond, James Martel, Sandee Noda, Tammie Ridgell, Elena Stoian, Lark Winner, UAPD rep

### **Agenda topic # 3 – Approval of minutes from October 28, 2021 meeting**

- **Jennifer Summit** requested approval of meeting minutes. Motion for approval made, seconded, passed.

### **Agenda topic # 4 – President’s Message**

- Shared the CSU Board of Trustees approved a historic ask of the State for its 2022-2023 budget request. This year’s budget is often referred to as historic, but it only restored funds taken the prior year. It’s still early but the State is projecting a surplus again, anticipating a positive budget.
- CSU priorities are recurring base funding, mostly for the Graduation Initiative, and the CO has set ambitious goals for eliminating equity gaps in graduation rates. Funds for Basic needs were requested as well as new funds for bridging the equity divide through technology, as exposed through the pandemic. They also added funding requests for infrastructure, mandatory costs and enrollment growth, largely for SoCal campuses that have seen tremendous demand.
- A new line item which received absolute consensus was the need for employee compensation increases. A 4% increase aligns with what state employees were awarded.
- State typically ends up with one-time funds and they will hopefully help with deferred maintenance funding.

- CSU is under-resourced, and this has to be the message all advocate for. CSU is also advocating for state assistance for student housing. CSU is affordable for students living at home, but living independently elsewhere is less affordable due to the cost of housing. This is particularly acute in San Francisco; the state legislative analyst did an analysis that showed the cost of living off-campus is about the same or slightly less than living on-campus, especially in San Francisco and San Jose. Concerns for staff and faculty housing also occur in these same areas. It is the most significant ask, but all are hopeful for the Governor's budget to be released in January.
- **Genie Stowers** asked if Kevin Mullen might help with student housing, as he's alum.
- **President Mahoney** replied there is widespread support for student housing, and she talks about it whenever she runs into any of our alum elected officials. Most important are those who run the budget committee.
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar** asked about the staff/faculty survey mentioned at the BOT meeting last week addressing compensation and working conditions, and if that might change the budget ask.
- **President Mahoney** responded the CSU/CSUEU co-sponsored a Mercer study about staff salary inequity, compression, inversion and step increases, and there may be a similar for faculty salary as well. The CO said the budget ask may be augmented depending on study results. There was unanimous support for compensation increases for CSU employees.

#### Agenda topic (new) – UBC Charge workgroup update

- *(see slides 7 -8)*
- **Teddy Albiniaik** announced the workgroup will review two processes in Spring not codified in the Charge:
  - Mid-term vacancies
  - Staff nomination process for multiple staff vacancies in Spring 2022
- For faculty, will follow Senate's current process: ExCom drafts a ranked list of experienced members then sends to UBC Steering Committee for nomination, then onto the President for appointment.
- Encouraged faculty to join the service pool to be considered for committee nominations
- Criteria considered is college representation, previous UBC experience, etc.
- For staff seating, all five members began their terms same time, so all terms expire same time. To stagger terms moving forward, three staff seats will be extended to retain experience, opening two seats in Spring 2022.
- Steering Committee and Charge workgroup will work together on these procedures

#### Agenda topic # 5 – Transparency Topic: HEERF

- *(see slides 9 - 18)*
- **Jeff Wilson** began the presentation showing the three levels of HEERF funds: HEERF 1 (CARES Act), HEERF II, HEERF III (American Rescue Plan). (see slides)
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar** asked what happens to allocated HEERF if not spent by deadline in April – can they be reallocated or does it have to be returned.
- **Jeff Wilson** responded they will reallocate the funds to make sure 100% of the funds benefit campus. Some projects need additional funding. There is are also significant amounts of lost revenue that has not been recovered to consider. By April, will bring back to this committee a recommendation to recover lost revenue rather than return funds to the federal government.
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar** asked if there was a priority list for the redistribution of funds.
- **Jeff Wilson** responded they will have that in January. They haven't done that level of work yet.
- **Dylan Mooney** remarked the request for projects was not well publicized, and asked how readily available the list of projects is, with the project directors, as it's been difficult to find out who to contact. Asked if it can be publicized on the webpage to make it publicly available, so those who may have ideas on how to use funds will know who to contact.

- **Michael Goldman** added he's also concerned funds may not be spent in time and asked if there can be more resources put towards HR and Procurement, at least temporarily, to make sure there are no internal holds to these projects.
- **Jeff Wilson** responded there are two procurement officers dedicated to and funded by HEERF to ensure purchasing is moving as efficiently as possible. They have to be careful to justify the relevance to the pandemic. The reference to HR is maybe one to consider. Will confer with AVP Williams to determine if necessary.
- **Teddy Albiniak** acknowledged this topic came from UBC Office Hours and appreciates UBC addressing it. Asked to clarify an item that came up in the roadshows and also the Senate re: the \$1M left in reserves for economic uncertainty, and that it might be more than that by the end of April, if all funds are not spent.
- **Jeff Wilson** confirmed they have been advised that if labor negotiations result in costs incurred during the current year, they will be required to use HEERF funds that were for lost revenue, as campus does not have the resources to generally fund them. There is no projection of that number yet.

### **Agenda topic # 6 – Updates/Informational Item: Downtown Campus update**

*(see slides 19-32)*

- **Jason Porth** began his presentation with the history of SF State's downtown location:
  - SF State was founded 1899 at a downtown location; Holloway campus did not exist until after WWII.
  - When moved to Holloway, a presence downtown remained at various locations; showed a photo of the downtown campus in 1964 at 540 Powell (now the Academy of Art College).
  - Reasons for keeping a downtown campus include remaining in close proximity to the students the colleges and programs serve; day and evening classes for those who work in the downtown area.
  - The cost of having space downtown has increased significantly.
  - Unlike the Holloway campus, colleges pay rent for space at the downtown campus.
  - Currently the downtown campus is located at 835 Market Street, next to the Westfield Centre, on the 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> floors. This current space is large and has been under-occupied for many years, leading to subleases, without which the university would have to pay the cost for empty space.
  - Current lease at 835 Market expires December 31<sup>st</sup> and campus will move to 160 Spear.
  - (see slides)
- **Michael Goldman** confirmed SF State is in places where students want to be and asked about a San Mateo presence, where there's a diverse community without access to a nearby public university and a large biotechnology industry as opportunity for BA's, certificate and graduate degrees.
- Also, referred to the expense of moving colleges from the old downtown campus site to the new space or back the Holloway campus, and the rationale for charging them for those moves.
- **Jason Porth** agreed it makes sense to have a stronger presence in San Mateo, and there was an LFCOB cohort meeting at SSF City Hall for some time. This is an opportunity that can be pursued with a revenue source, similar to the downtown campus where students pay a fee for use of that space, although should be mindful of charging students fees. Classes at Holloway campus don't charge fees, so desire vs. cost to be weighed.
- Has tried to mitigate furniture moving costs using downtown campus trust funds and utilizing furniture already in new space.
- **Genie Stowers** noted MPA had a paid cohort in San Mateo County about 10 years ago and they've continued a strong partnership with San Mateo County, so may be good to offer cohorts there.
- Surveys of MPA students over the years offered the opportunity to move back and they've consistently shown a willingness to pay a fee for the benefit of being downtown, close to government and nonprofit offices where they work. Staying downtown has always been led by the students. MPA will now be on main campus while still teaching at the downtown campus.
- **Darleen Yee-Melichar** asked about s.f. rent in the new space and if it offers sufficient space for faculty advising.

- **Jason Porth** shared the current space is \$40/sf and new space is \$60/sf, but has less space to manage (25 sf vs. 125 sf, with no subtenants). There is some space in the building that can be used for touch-down space as well as empty classrooms, when not in use.

#### **Agenda topic # 6 – Updates/Informational Item: IDC Workgroup update**

*(see slides 33-39)*

- **Eugene Sivadas** shared an update on the IDC workgroup (see slides)
- **Kathleen Mortier** acknowledged IDC is more than a budgetary issue and hopes this will be included in what it means to faculty and the work that goes into obtaining grants, many of those hours in their off time, with the competitiveness and limited pool of federal, state and philanthropy funds. The system should not be so complex it de-incentivizes motivation. A lot of grants also provide funding and tuition support for students. Looking at all the angles, grants with little IDC provide faculty experience to apply for larger grants for career growth as well.
- **Eugene Sivadas** welcomed anyone interested to contact members of the IDC workgroup.
- **Akm Newaz** noted COSE is the majority IDC generator; suggested the workgroup may not have adequate representation from COSE.
- **Eugene Sivadas** recognized COSE's IDC contributions in the slides shown. Reminded all the workgroup members were elected by the UBC and will review perspectives from all stakeholders, faculty and deans.
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar** reiterated Kathleen's comments re: faculty consultation, especially the PI's and PDs, inclusive of tenured and tenure-track faculty and those just starting their research agendas for RTP reasons. IDC has impact on research influence and involving students in high impact practices. Suggested the workgroup meet with Dr. Ganesh Raman, Asst Vice Chancellor of Research, for a multi-campus system perspective.

#### **Agenda topic # 7 – Presentation: University Consolidated Budget Update**

*(see slides 40-56)*

- **Jeff Wilson** began the presentation on University Consolidated & Capital Budget Update.
- Remarked most of the time the UBC discusses the General-Fund operating budget for all campus units, but its only one of the components of the larger consolidated budget. Two other components will be presented (see slides).
- **Jennifer Summit** noted no hands raised and deferred any questions to the public forum.

#### **Agenda topic # 8 – Action Item: Chargeback Governance Committee**

*(see slides 57-58)*

- **Mary Menees** reported this topic came from an Office Hours Staff session, and is glad to see it moving forward. Noted chargebacks can affect a department's budget, and Facilities presentation last month was helpful. A governance committee of some kind was suggested to create transparency and literacy.
- Shared proposed governance committee recommendation, as directed by the Admin & Finance VP & CFO.
- **Dylan Mooney** asked about committee membership balance and how members might be identified, and whether they're specific groups of people involved in the chargeback processes, such as building coordinators.
- Also asked for clarity on the sentence that reads "...committee should not advance or approve practices negatively affecting the campus's or divisions overall budgets." Assuming improvements recommended may readjust or rebalance processes of how chargebacks work, this may result in a change in recouping funds, which might be seen as a negative effect.
- **Mary Menees** replied the VP & CFO will seek a diverse group of stakeholders and may request consultation to talk about who might be included, but is unsure what the process will be.

- Regarding negatively affecting budgets, the idea was to prevent something like deferred maintenance being pushed back on a department. Departments being treated equitably with transparency and clarity is important.
- **Jennifer Summit** asked Jeff how he'd like to receive this kind of feedback in the creation of this committee.
- **Jeff Wilson** replied this is a recommendation from UBC to the President to charge the A&F VP & CFO to compose this committee. Then, will work with UBC to flesh out the charge for review and feedback.
- In response to the question about budget accountability, a committee should be empowered for decision-making that's effective – at the same time, responsive to the university's budgetary reality that exists on campus, and put that into some clearer language to make sure chargebacks don't become a financial liability for the university or any department/division.
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar** moved to forward this recommendation to President Mahoney, asking her to consider diversity and equity issues for inclusive membership.
- **Michael Goldman** commented membership recommendation might be more specific rather than asking the President to appoint members, as it seems a bit premature for an action item.
- **Mary Menees** offered, as a member of the Steering Committee, to work with them to figure out the best membership and present back to UBC next month.
- **Jenifer Summit** summarized this will be a first reading, going back to the Steering Committee for further work on clarity on accountability and transparency, and to present back next meeting.

#### Agenda topic # 9 – Public Forum

- **Jennifer Summit** opened the public forum, beginning with public comment on the proposed chargeback governance committee recommendation.
- **Mary Menees** asked if there was any support for it.
- **Frank Fasano** stated his support for it, as it's important for there to be buy-in, understanding and transparency around this. There's no standardization in the CSU for how the recharges are done and only vague statements in policy and executive orders. Reiterated that Facilities is a zero-based budget organization and there's no money being made, and they charge based on what it costs to do the work.
- **Jennifer Summit** thanked all for comments on this issue, and shared ways to send feedback to the UBC.
- **Mari Hulick** asked if departments are able to schedule classes at the downtown campus, as her department may have students who would be willing to pay a fee to have the extra classes in that location.
- **Jason Porth** replied they would have to be mindful about the students who already pay for space there, and there would have to be some cost-sharing. Suggested discussions with CEL Dean or LFCOB Dean. Student fees also require consultation with the Student Advisory Committee.
- **Laura Moorhead** asked about the IDC workgroup discussion, and understands COSE's concerns about workgroup representation. Remarked all faculty should be encouraged to help bring in funds and it's important to consider the whole university, not necessarily where the funds come in from.
- **Jennifer Summit** directed the comment to Dean Sivadas to share how the IDC workgroup can receive feedback in consultation with faculty.
- **Eugene Sivadas** replied he and the workgroup are happy to meet individually or collectively to incorporate all perspectives. Shared his email address in the Chat.
- **Jan Waller** commented on the consolidated budget and the slide that showed salaries (slide 49) and asked if the pie chart can show the numbers of salaries that are included in that calculation. For example: how many management and supervisory positions are being supported in those ranges.

- **Jeff Wilson** replied the data is supported by underlying details so he'd work with Elena when she returns to see how to provide the information.

**Co-Chairs adjourned the meeting approximately 12:00 PM**

- Next meeting: Thursday, December 16, 2021, 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM

/nr-g

**FROM THE CHAT:**

10:14:24 From Member, Joshua Ochoa (he/him) to Everyone:

Thank you President Mahoney!

10:14:57 From Member, Ben Kumli (he/him) to Everyone:

And, thanks to all those who volunteer their time to participate in this shared governance and do not receive any assigned time for this service!

10:19:31 From Member, T Albinia (he/him/his) to Everyone:

[https://sfsu.co1.qualtrics.com/jfe/form/SV\\_4JDTWvYYGLnOgTg](https://sfsu.co1.qualtrics.com/jfe/form/SV_4JDTWvYYGLnOgTg)

10:22:03 From Nancy Ganner to Everyone:

email [ubc@sfsu.edu](mailto:ubc@sfsu.edu) to attend Staff or Faculty/MPP Office hours tomorrow 10am

10:35:00 From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone:

@Dylan that is a very good suggestion

10:36:04 From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone:

@Mari Thanks!

10:39:37 From Member, Kathleen Mortier to Everyone:

I appreciate how each agenda item is clearly identified

10:40:59 From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone:

I was just there yesterday.

10:54:42 From Member, Mary Menees to Everyone:

Thank you, Jason, for your excellent report.

10:55:14 From Member, Joshua Ochoa (he/him) to Everyone:

SO excited to be learning in person in the Spring for MPA!

10:55:32 From Member, Joshua Ochoa (he/him) to Everyone:

(at the new downtown location) :)

11:03:32 From Member, Joshua Ochoa (he/him) to Everyone:

Thank you Jason!

11:05:04 From Member S. Evrim Ozer (they/them/theirs) to Everyone:

Hi Jason, thank you for the presentation. Might you know whether the WeWork contract allows telecommuting employees or employees working away from the office, such as donor visits, to use the space?

11:09:31 From Michael Scott to Everyone:

5 campuses have stateside IDC but the other four do not have much grant activity

11:09:37 From Michael Scott to Everyone:

5 CSU campuses

11:11:10 From Michael Scott to Everyone:

We only accept zero percent IDC grants that have significant student impact

11:14:12 From Michael Scott to Everyone:

Many Dept of Ed grants have 8% IDC but provide SIGNIFICANT student support. These students wouldn't be at SFSU without this support so the grants effectively bring in additional tuition dollars.

11:14:47 From Member, Kathleen Mortier to Everyone:

Thank you for pointing that out Michael

11:14:49 From Michael Scott to Everyone:

Newaz numbers are incorrect

11:16:55 From Michael Scott to Everyone:

We brought in \$4.5 million last year. CoSE typically brings in 70% of the total. 5 years ago we brought in \$3.5M

11:17:15 From Member, Dwayne Banks to Everyone:

Michael, thanks for the clarification.

11:17:58 From Member, Darlene Yee-Melichar to Everyone:

For IDC meeting plan, perhaps meet with Dr. Ganesh Raman, AVC Research, CSU CO and get a multi-campus, system perspective?

11:18:30 From Michael Scott to Everyone:

All the other active campuses run their grants through foundations and it's a VERY different process than stateside

11:37:52 From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone:

And clarity around the accountability/transparency section

11:40:01 From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone:

I apologize, I had to leave during this discussion, so I am behind. It's the "great panic" before the Fall Break, and there's a lot going on in the department!

11:40:30 From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone:

I will review the slides when they are available and possibly come to the office hours.

11:46:53 From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone:

Thank you!

11:47:08 From Alex Hwu (he/him/his) to Everyone:

Mari, happy to explore options with you

11:49:33 From Jen Waller to Everyone:

Thank you. This is my first meeting, and I'm impressed by the quality of the presentations, and please forgive my exceedingly simple observation here. It could be useful when presenting the percentage of management and staff salaries in a pie chart, to include the top and bottom range of each group of salaries along with the number of people salaried in each group. That was my first thought in seeing which percentage slice was attributed to each group.

11:51:38 From Member Eugene Sivadas to Everyone:

sivadas@sfsu.edu

11:54:54 From Member S. Evrim Ozer (they/them/theirs) to Everyone:

Thank you, Jen. That's very valuable feedback reminds me of my studies in the technical writing program here at SF State and what I learned there. Thanks for sharing.

11:55:27 From Jen Waller to Everyone:

Thank you, for your patience.

11:55:30 From Member, Michael Goldman to Everyone:

Happy Thanksgiving!

11:55:35 From Nancy Ganner to Everyone:

email ubc@sfsu.edu for office hour access

11:55:53 From Member S. Evrim Ozer (they/them/theirs) to Everyone:

Happy Thanksgiving holidays next week and Native American Heritage Month!

11:56:15 From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone:

Thank you!

11:56:25 From Nanette Davy to Everyone:

Thank You!