



University Budget Committee Meeting Minutes

- Meeting Date: Thursday, Jan. 23, 2025, via Zoom
- Voting Members Present: Robert Collins, Jennifer Daly, Brad Erickson, Brandon Foley, Daniel Paz Gabriner, Michael Goldman, Mari Hulick, Jeff Jackanicz, Crystal Kam, Mary Menees, Michael Scott, Dylan Mooney, Tiffany O’Shaughnessy, Irina Okhremtchouk, Eugene Sivadas, Genie Stowers, Amy Sueyoshi, Alaric Trousdale, Jackson Wilson, Jeff Wilson
- Non-voting members present: Christine Hintermann, Chanda Jensen, Katie Lynch, Lynn Mahoney, Cesar Mozo, Tammie Ridgell, Jamil Sheared, Elena Stoian
- Guest presenters: n/a
- Members Absent: Emiliano Balistreri, Deborah Elia, Ashkan Forouhi, Tim Jenkins, Lorena Mejia, Jamillah Moore, David Schachman, David Miller Shevelev, Venesia Thompson-Ramsay
- Meeting coordination: Nancy Ganner, Mariela Esquivel

Accompanying presentation can be found here: [UBC Presentation Jan. 23, 2025](#)

UBC co-chairs called the meeting to order at approximately 11:03 A.M.

Agenda topic – Welcome from Co-Chairs and Agenda review

- **Co-chairs** welcomed committee members and guests.

Agenda topic – Member roll call

- Quorum established.

Agenda topic – President’s Remarks

- **President Mahoney** appreciated the engagement of 236 attending this meeting so far. Addressed recent news about Sonoma State’s (SSU) budget cuts, empathizing with their campus community. Has heard from SFSU’s student athletes expressing anxiety. SFSU has been working hard to not land where SSU is today, recognizing hardships already experienced with reductions in lecturer faculty, less hiring of tenure line faculty and MPPs and reducing other costs to save \$27M so far. The 7.9 5% cut in State funding is catastrophic; unfunded portions of recent compensation increases add \$8M to the budget deficit. SSU’s actions are a wake-up to the State. Is grateful for shared governance work being done at Academic Senate with the Institutional Review Committee (IRC). Emphasized all this work is urgent, as is any restructuring of curriculum, departments and offices as well.
- Will be speaking at the CSU Board of Trustees meeting next week to remind them the Governor’s actions cannot be weathered without laying off personnel. The cuts hurt all CSU students and employees. Was grateful for CFA rep Brad Erickson’s comments at the University Retreat last week noting these cuts are one of the gravest threats facing the CSU system right now. The value of higher education is changing and enrollment concerns are not limited to just a few campuses; campuses like Sac State are talking about \$40M in losses even with thriving enrollment. The [State compact](#) that was to help increase enrollment by 3,500 students will add more pressure on the CO to grow SoCal campuses, furthering the CSU reallocation plan to reduce funding to SFSU and, could mean deeper enrollment decline as SoCal campuses like Long Beach, SDSU and UCSC have to admit more students.

The Governor cannot guarantee the compact in the future as his term ends in 2026. There is a lot of advocacy work to be done.

- **Brandon Foley** commented lecturers are nervous about layoffs, which makes their students feel less confident about where the campus is headed. SSU cuts were brutal and many felt were made without notice. Asked if SFSU will be transparent about resizing efforts.
- **President Mahoney** replied at SFSU there are still many classes with open seats so students do have access to classes. When she receives an email from a student that says they can't find a class, she immediately connects them with the advising center. If there is a bottleneck for classes it will be reviewed so students can get the classes they need to graduate. The campus should be able to resize without hurting student potential. The State cuts will have an impact on the campus and she's trying to reassure everyone this is a process of transition, and the campus will be better for it. Urges colleagues to stop disparaging the university as it hurts student morale, and hurts enrollment efforts. With regards to funding cuts that do hurt students, the State Legislature is responsible for those decisions and should be hearing from them.
- **Lori Beth Way** added there are some areas such as written communication, with hundreds of seats open. They are hearing rhetoric about lack of classes available but the classes remain open.
- **President Mahoney** continued its possible a student may be seeking a class with a specific faculty member who is not teaching this semester and feels they're unable to access a class, when there may be class sections open with other faculty. The campus has been transparent about what is happening and invites students to learn about how the budget works so they understand. Outcomes may be painful during the transition to reducing the campus size to meet student demand.
- **Alaric Trousdale** asked if she knew of the SSU process for making decisions about which programs get discontinued and how that process compares to SFSU's.
- **President Mahoney** replied she doesn't know what their process is but they don't seem to have an IRC, nor this much engagement in their budget processes.
- **Jackson Wilson** asked about the State compact with the UC/CSU and how the UC can move forward with their part (increasing local enrollment) when the CSU may not be able to.
- **President Mahoney** explained the UCs will benefit from the compact because they *can* increase enrollment; legislators don't seem to understand enrollment systems and if the UC's grow, then the CSU's will shrink. One legislator commented "if the UC's can grow and the CSU's cannot, let's just fund the UC's". They don't seem to understand the UC's don't have the capacity (UC = 10 campuses, CSU = 23), the student housing nor the aging infrastructure the CSU's do, and then CSU campuses will be underused. More CSU's will be like SSU - with only a few thousand students. She's spoken to the Chancellor about this being the moment to educate the legislature about enrollment, as they're responsible for UC/CSU funding. SSU's concerns are a wake-up call about what can happen. If funding for the compact does materialize permanently, then possibly only the UC's will benefit.
- **Genie Stowers** commented more transparency is needed, even if painful to hear. There can't be news that everything will be ok, because this a bad situation. This campus has to brace for and deal with realities, and try to advocate. She worked on developing the IRC at Senate over a decade ago and even though it's gone through many revisions, is glad it exists now. It's unfortunate it needs to be used, but glad there's something ready to be used designed to provide participation and collaboration across faculty, staff, students and administrators.
- **President Mahoney** agreed about transparency, and understands that years ago SSU optimistically expressed enrollment would improve, as it felt better at the time. Responding to a Chat post from Jennifer about empty student seats: Lori Beth Way could bring this to the Chairs for analysis of where the open seats are and why they're still hearing about issues with class access. Regarding the resizing of SFSU, encouraged it can be done, together. It will be painful particularly for some departments/colleges. Regarding budget cuts: the State says it's running a slight surplus and Governor Newsom has backpedaled from cuts in the past, so she remains hopeful that the \$7.95M funding for the CSU will be restored. Urged all to advocate and fight.
- No further questions received.

Agenda topic – SF State Budget Presentation

- **Jeff Wilson** gave a presentation on the Governor's January proposal, released January 10th.
- (see slides)
- **Mary Menees** asked when information will be received for everyone to help advocate.
- **Jeff Wilson** shared he attended a meeting last week where CSU's Vice Chancellor for External Relations and Communications spoke about restarting advocacy that had not been emphasized recently. One of those will be direct communications to employees and alums to provide specific examples of actions that can be taken, including participating in advocacy days March 19th and June 6th.
- **Genie Stowers** asked Senate Chair Jackson Wilson if he could describe the IRC timeline and process.
- **Jackson Wilson** explained the IRC is made up of 12 faculty, 2 deans; undergraduate and graduate, and staff members will be confirmed soon. First meeting on 1/31/25 will discuss deliverables: recommendations of program discontinuances in relation to the dollar target of \$15.5M over 4 years to allow for teach out (even if programs closed in year one, time is needed for savings to occur), and there may be additional recommendations. Academic Deans will make their own independent recommendations, but will also review those made by IRC and the Provost's Council. From there they will recommend actions and discontinuances will be passed onto the Senate Educational Policies Council to go through the normal process of academic program discontinuance.
- **Genie Stowers** asked, prompted by Lori Beth Way's post to the Chat; if teach out requirements are an SFSU or CSU requirement. SSU is only allowing students with 60 units to be taught out.
- **Lori Beth Way** replied it's an accreditation requirement; every school has to have a plan, but the plan could mean different things. Ex: a student comes to SFSU to finish their degree, and they could finish in their major or may need course substitutions to complete the degree. There's flexibility but it's a WASC requirement to teach out. Will look more into SSU's 60 unit requirement with her liaison at WASC.
- **Danny Paz Gabriner** asked about scenario-planning: at October's meeting there was to be a \$28M deficit for the '25-'26 year. Since no scenario-planning was discussed in November, asked for an update.
- **Jeff Wilson** responded an enrollment update will be available February to inform tuition forecasts, which will change scenario-planning. Also will tweak any assumptions from last year related to things that happened this year. Scenarios are helpful but will change as cost increases for utilities, insurance, etc. are adjusted. The first rollout of scenario-planning will be presented in February.

Agenda topic – Public Forum

- **Katie Lynch** responded to Burcu's question in the Chat ("*Is there a contact person at SF State to reach out to about students who may need to transfer from Sonoma to SF State as a result of discontinuance?*"); her team is compassionately in touch with SSU about opportunities for their students currently enrolled and also applicants for those programs, in coordination with the CO, to explore all opportunities. If there are students interested in transferring to SFSU, send them to her or Camille Rieck-Armstrong, Undergraduate Admissions and Recruitment Director who would be happy to discuss any transfer opportunities. They're also working closely on any kind of formalized plans to help support students that may need different opportunities.
- **Jeff Wilson** asked if SFSU will guarantee admission for any SSU student.
- **Katie Lynch** replied SFSU would guarantee admission to any SSU student in good academic standing, and any applicant to SSU that meets the CSU minimum (the normal process). Her team is working on what that language would look like, and carefully, in a way that supports SSU.
- **Jennifer Shea** commented the MPA program was one of the SSU's discontinued programs. As they were struggling for years, she's been in discussions with them about ways to partner. Asked to what degree Enrollment Management might handle discontinued grad program/students, like the MPA.

- **Sophie Clavier** shared their approach will follow Enrollment Management's lead. They're empathetic with SSU colleagues but will offer room for students who want to transfer, after normal review. She talked with SSU's grad Dean and they've discussed this.
- **Amy Sueyoshi** added direct faculty connections between both campuses is best at this time to see if they can be of assistance. There is no centralized plan for all grad programs that may have been discontinued at SSU. There are no systemwide degrees as articulation across campuses differ. That was explored at the undergrad level some time ago but departments across the campuses differ and things can get complicated. Faculty who have relationships with SSU faculty can reach out and exchange collaboration and flexibility for the student(s), and that's encouraged as a support. Suggested to Jennifer Shea if there is a systemwide degree opportunity for MPA, she can work with her to discuss with the Chancellor's Office, as a pilot program.
- **Alesha Sohler** asked regarding the 7.9% State cut to the CSU, how much of that is SFSU's.
- **Jeff Wilson** agreed with Danny Paz Gabriner's post to the Chat: approximately \$20.7M, according to the [Oct. 2024 meeting slides](#). That's according to the typical percent of CSU reductions, and there will be an update at February's meeting.
- No further questions received.

Co-Chairs adjourned the meeting approximately 10:54 AM

- **Jeff Wilson** noted next month's meeting time is as regularly scheduled, Feb. 27th from 10AM – 12PM via zoom. This meeting hit the maximum of 300 guests and to keep the meeting interactive (vs. a webinar), will look into what can be offered for students so they have opportunity to learn about the budget.
- Next meeting: Thursday, February 27, 2025 from 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM via Zoom

-end (nrg)

From the Chat:

11:00:13 From Iese Esera, CSSA to Everyone: Good morning Gators!

11:02:21 From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone: Good morning!!

11:02:39 From Megumi Fuse to Everyone: good morning!

11:06:45 From Member Christine Hintermann to Everyone: ❤️

11:11:15 From Brad Erickson (he/him) to Everyone: I'm here.

11:13:45 From Alesha Sohler (She/Her) to Everyone: How does the upcoming Governor election impact the deferral of the compact funding?

11:13:58 From Alesha Sohler (She/Her) to Everyone: Exactly!!!!

11:14:28 From Aaron Kerner - Director of the School of Cinema to Everyone: How can we admit more students when we're already accepting upwards of 90% of applicants?

11:14:28 From Alesha Sohler (She/Her) to Everyone: Thank you for your transparency ❤️

11:14:40 From Member Christine Hintermann to Everyone: The 2026 race is on for California governor - CalMatters

11:14:59 From member, Katie Lynch (she/her/hers) to Everyone: Replying to "How can we admit more students when we're already ...": @Aaron, the system as a whole. Some campuses are still highly impacted

11:16:54 From Member Brad Erickson (he/him) to Everyone: Please don't use the phrase "lecturers and faculty." Lecturer faculty are faculty.

11:18:02 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: We still have 24,712 seats open in the schedule.

11:18:08 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: https://webfocus.sfsu.edu/ibi_apps/bip/portal/Daily_Course_Enrollments

11:18:18 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: You can see where the seats are open at that link.

11:18:39 From Alesha Sohler (She/Her) to Everyone: Replying to "We still have 24,712 seats open in the schedule."
Do you know how many of those are asynchronous, online, OR program specific?

11:19:20 From lese Esera, CSSA to Everyone: Agreed!!

11:19:47 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi to Everyone: We've been committed to transparency through UBC, IRC, and budget subcommittees in various colleges and Academic Resources.

11:19:53 From Alesha Sohler (She/Her) to Everyone: Replying to "https://webfocus.sfsu.edu/ibi_apps/bip/portal/Dail...":
Is anyone else having trouble with the link?

11:19:55 From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) on Bay Miwok lands to Everyone: but it was true and completely transparent. I for one would prefer the real truth rather than telling people what they want to hear.

11:20:18 From Frances Wilkerson to Everyone: maybe they are the wrong classes that are open

11:20:29 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi to Everyone: And Brandon we will continue our commitment to transparency.

11:20:52 From Marisa Jimison to Everyone: Replying to "https://webfocus.sfsu.edu/ibi_apps/bip/portal/Dail...":
It works okay for me. Maybe a different web browser?

11:21:25 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: @Frances Wilkerson - I'm happy to look into any class where that might be the case. I just need someone to point us in that direction. When we've talked with particular student, we've been able to find them the courses they need (maybe not their first choice), but classes that help them make progress to degree.

11:22:06 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: As Lynn mentioned, Computer Science is an exception because we've had a hard time holding on to faculty there given salary restrictions.

11:22:15 From Jace Allen to Everyone: Replying to "https://webfocus.sfsu.edu/ibi_apps/bip/portal/Dail...":
Yeah, it does not work on Firefox, but it does on Chrome - in my case

11:23:38 From Sutee Sujitparapitaya to Everyone: @Jace Allen It works on Firefox if you use the latest.

11:23:42 From Member Brad Erickson (he/him) to Everyone: The city of Berkeley has limited UC enrollment due to housing concerns.

11:24:23 From Robert Calhoun to Everyone: Replying to "The city of Berkeley has limited UC enrollment due...":
They get in a dog fight over there anytime you try to build an apartment building.

11:24:25 From Jennifer Shea (she/her) to Everyone: I'd be interested in learning more about which seats are open and why. For example, are course caps realistic given the number of majors in any given area? Or is it really just a matter of advising, redirecting students to other suitable courses?

11:24:34 From Guest Ifeoma Kiddoe Nwankwo to Everyone: More than others anywhere in the country

11:24:40 From Member Christine Hintermann to Everyone: Replying to "The city of Berkeley has limited UC enrollment due...": City of Berkeley has been trying for a decade ringing that bell. Also the cost of infrastructure.

11:25:26 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: @Jennifer Shea (she/her) you can see at that link where the seats are by GE Area, college, and undergraduate or graduate. You can get to the section level.

11:25:29 From Rick Harvey to Everyone: [Discontinuing and Suspending Degree Programs.pdf](#)

11:25:42 From Jace Allen to Everyone: Replying to "@Jace Allen It works on Firefox if you use the lat...":
It could just be mine, but the screen just says loading without ever transitioning to the dashboard.

11:25:47 From Jennifer Waller to Everyone: As a UBC guest, SFSU alumnus and LCA staff person, I have to commend the UBC for doing this really very hard work well. Witnessing the cooperative nature of the UBC team is inspiring and I appreciate the commitment to transparency. Thank you.

11:25:50 From Guest Ifeoma Kiddoe Nwankwo to Everyone: Thanks, Rick

11:25:51 From Rick Harvey to Everyone: Sonoma State policy on Discontinuing and Suspending programs is in the chat

11:25:56 From Marisa Jimison to Everyone: IMHO I think a challenge we face is divulging the information to the students in an approachable way. I feel like the university has been transparent, but students aren't aware of how to get these updates or get overwhelmed and look away when they get overloaded with details.

11:26:18 From davidsmith to Everyone: Replying to "I'd be interested in learning more about which sea...": In my experience, many course caps have no apparent basis in reality. I have asked where the caps on classes originate and how I can change them and everyone just shrugs.

11:26:44 From Member - Jennifer Daly to Everyone: Replying to "@Jace Allen It works on Firefox if you use the lat...": It's working on Firefox for me, but I think I have an update to run, so perhaps it's not working correctly with the current version of Firefox

11:26:54 From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) on Bay Miwok lands to Everyone: Wildfires will soak up most of that surplus, I think.

11:27:29 From Member Christine Hintermann to Everyone: Replying to "Wildfires will soak up most of that surplus, I thi...": and lawsuits against the current administration.

11:29:22 From Sutee Sujitparapitaya to Everyone: @Jace Allen Make sure to clear the browser history and cached files in your Firefox. I am using Firefox to design and test all reports. You can contact me if you still run into the issue

11:29:28 From Matt Itelson to Everyone: Replying to "IMHO I think a challenge we face is divulging the ...": Great point. The budget process is complex. I am barely beginning to understand and I've worked here for a quarter of a century.

11:30:13 From Jace Allen to Everyone: Replying to "@Jace Allen It works on Firefox if you use the lat...": I have version 134.02 and it says that it is up to date. Not sure what it inhibiting it if it works for others.

11:30:37 From Jace Allen to Everyone: Replying to "@Jace Allen Make sure to clear the browser history...": Thanks, Sutee. I will try that and get back to you.

11:30:47 From Jennifer Waller to Everyone: Replying to "IMHO I think a challenge we face is divulging the ...": I worked with my children's public school foundation about 15 years ago, and the presentation of how the budget works has come a long way! That last slide was excellent!

11:30:55 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone: Replying to "@Jace Allen It works on Firefox if you use the lat...": It only works on Chrome in my computer.

11:31:38 From Member - Jennifer Daly to Everyone: Replying to "@Jace Allen It works on Firefox if you use the lat...": I'm running Firefox 134.0 on this computer and it's functioning for me.

11:32:05 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone: Replying to "@Jace Allen It works on Firefox if you use the lat...": I think it works on PC Firefox. On Mac you need to use Chrome.

11:39:09 From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone: Reminder: No UBC Office Hours Tomorrow

11:40:03 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: Sonoma State is only allowing students with 60 units to remain in the discontinuing majors past this May.

11:41:20 From Nancy Ganner to Everyone: Replying to "Reminder: No UBC Office Hours Tomorrow": Thanks, Dylan. Everyone, UBC Office Hours will happen as usual after next month's meeting on Feb. 27. Email for the zoom link if needed. Feedback for the UBC is welcome anytime at ubc@sfsu.edu

11:42:40 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: Lots of information on Sonoma here. <https://budget.sonoma.edu/budget-deficit-resources>

11:43:16 From Burcu Ellis to Everyone: Is there a contact person at SF State to reach out to about students who may need to transfer from Sonoma to SF State as a result of discontinuance?

11:45:20 From Burcu Ellis to Everyone: Thank you!

11:46:55 From member, Katie Lynch (she/her/hers) to Everyone: Camille Rieck-Armstrong or ugadmit@sfsu.edu. you can also always send folks my way at katielynch@sfsu.edu

11:48:53 From Member Jackson Wilson (he, him, his) to Everyone: Replying to "Is there a contact person at SF State to reach out...": Advisors, including Joseph Montoya, have been incredible about reaching out to students that have contacted me with an interest in transferring to SFSU.

11:49:01 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: I'm not getting traction on this. Would LOVE if faculty want to assist on this.

11:49:09 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: Exactly as the Provost said.

11:49:36 From Michael Anderson to Everyone: Should interested faculty reach out to you about system-wide discussions?

11:50:38 From Michael Anderson to Everyone: about the potential of system-wide degrees that is.

11:50:49 From Lori Beth Way to Everyone: @Michael Anderson - sure!

11:51:02 From Member Danny Paz Gabriner to Everyone: presentation said 20.7M

11:51:07 From Member Danny Paz Gabriner to Everyone:
<https://adminfin.sfsu.edu/sites/default/files/documents/UBC%20Presentation%20Oct.%202024%20FINAL3.pdf>

11:51:46 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi to Everyone: @Michael Anderson It's best if you have a partner on another campus and them let your dean (and me) know. We tried doing a more administrative level system wide degree thing and we couldn't get any willing players.

11:51:49 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone: @Michael Anderson , here's a great article on just that:
<https://www.chronicle.com/article/higher-eds-grim-new-normal>

11:52:21 From Member Tiffany O'Shaughnessy, PhD (she/her) to Everyone: Thanks, all

11:52:26 From Jennifer Waller to Everyone: Thanks!

11:52:33 From Adriana Gallardo to Everyone: Thank you all

11:52:33 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone: Thanks all.

11:52:35 From Marisa Jimison to Everyone: Thank you