



University Budget Committee

Jeff Wilson, CFO & Vice President, Co-Chair

Amy Sueyoshi, Provost & Vice President, Co-Chair

UBC webpage: <https://adminfin.sfsu.edu/ubc>

Email: ubc@sfsu.edu

University Budget Committee Meeting Minutes

Meeting Date: Thursday, September 25, 2025, via Zoom

Voting Members Present: Shivani Bokka, Robert Keith Collins, Jennifer Daly, Brandon Foley, Michael Goldman, David Hellman, Mari Hulick, Alex Hwu, Crystal Kam, Irina Okhremtchouk, Mary Menees, Dylan Mooney, Jamillah Moore, Daniel Paz Gabriner, Alesha Sohler, Amy Sueyoshi, Alaric Trousdale, Jackson Wilson, Jeff Wilson

Non-voting members present: Deborah Elia, Christine Hintermann, Chanda Jensen, Katie Lynch, Lynn Mahoney, Cesar Mozo, Tammie Ridgell, David Schachman, Michael Scott, Jamil Sheared, Elena Stoian, Venesia Thompson-Ramsay

Guest presenters: Lori Beth Way

Members Absent: Emiliano Balistreri, Brad Erickson, Ashkan Forouhi, Jeff Jackanicz, Tim Jenkins, Genie Stowers

Meeting coordination: Nancy Ganner, Catherine Kim

Accompanying presentation can be found here: [UBC Presentation Sept. 28, 2025](#)

~~~~~  
UBC co-chairs called the meeting to order at approximately 10:03 A.M.

### **Agenda topic – Welcome from Co-Chairs and Agenda review**

- Co-chairs welcomed committee members and guests.
- Reminded of ways to contact UBC including office hours.

### **Agenda topics – Member roll call, Meeting Minutes approval**

- Quorum established.
- Minutes approved as submitted.

### **Agenda topic – President's Remarks**

- **Lynn Manohey** expressed continued gratitude for all attending UBC. Is waiting to hear about the CSU's decision re: the Governor's zero-interest [loan](#) offer and how CSU will use it. At the [recent CSU Board of Trustees \(BOT\) meeting](#), several board members felt strongly the CSU should not take it due to financial risk as it would be fully repayable July 1, 2026. CSU's ability to repay depends on restoration of State funds, but there's uncertainty about State budget. Presentation at BOT re: State's deficit shows volatility in both CA economy and budget as affected by federal action. Promised to share results; loan offer is well-intended but causes a lot of confusion.

- Met with the BOT about how SFSU is doing; they're impressed with how campus has navigated issues while remaining true to its mission of supporting free speech and student activism. UBC receives praise, restructured as she arrived at SFSU to where it is today with a Steering Committee, Office Hours, commitment to increased budget transparency, budget literacy and a forum for her to listen to community concerns. Attributes collegial discussions had at UBC for working through challenges. Thanked those who helped reformat UBC structure and the guests who attend meetings monthly.
- Responded to Chat; all CSU's took a 3% cut so if they accept the Governor's loan it would be for one-time expenses, possibly facilities upgrades or something she believes is financially risky, such as investing in compensation increases. While well-deserved, CSU may not be fully funded next year by CA so CSU would have a deeper funding cut. Encouraged all to discuss concerns with colleagues and students to share better understanding of budget cuts vs. temporary loan. \$7M structural deficit needs to be covered. SFSU will receive a CSU 3%-5% budget cut with unfunded mandatory costs, and there's a lot of work to do to reduce campus costs and invest in areas of growth at the same time.
- Encouraged all to become the best SFSU ambassadors in social media and everywhere. Even though things are hard, when the institution is maligned publicly it hurts students, hurts future enrollment and causes confusion. Students don't understand why tuition was raised while sections are reduced. These are two separate issues: tuition was raised because CA underfunds the CSU. Students are going to college in some of the hardest moments for higher education.
- Addressed a Chat comment that not all department enrollment is down and these are growth opportunities, which means shifting resources. With no new resources, campus has to embrace reductions with a growth mentality.
- Reiterated recent changes seem brutal but everyone needs to be part of the campus lift. The institution, the UBC, the work everyone does is exemplary for every university.
- **Mari Hulick** asked for clarification of campus goals; either with a pedagogy purview with students' education as the cornerstone, or if spreadsheets are going to be the primary purpose. Campus needs to be a destination. SJSU is successful because they have a large, working-class community with an easy commute to campus, unlike SFSU. Location can be managed with destination messaging. SFSU's real success is in the classroom, not in the numbers. If classes are overstuffed that needs to change to be truly student-centered.
- **Lynn Mahoney** agreed about the need to keep students central to SFSU purpose, but all can't be done as it has been. Times have changed. She's known since her first day the way 3:3 is implemented at SFSU was unsustainable. It was this way when enrollment was high, but SFSU can't stay below the system average SFR anymore. Growth can be had by doing things differently. In conversations with a small department recently where enrollment dropped so precipitously they can't mount the curriculum they created when the department was larger, and can't replace faculty due to not enough students. They'll have to meet student need with a different curriculum, so all departments need to get creative.
- **Mari Hulick** added CSUs talk mostly in WTU's, not 3:3 or 4:4, which may be a way to change the conversation as workload differs in departments.
- No further questions asked.

#### Agenda topic – SFSU Reserves

- **Elena Stoian** shared updates on carry-forward balances, designated reserves and fund activity.
- (see slides)

- **Danny Paz Gabriner** asked how campus reserves grew by \$14M while the deficit remains at \$40M. Also asked for details on 'programs and initiatives' on the slide.
- **Elena Stoian** stated 'programs and initiatives' are shown as a percentage and are designated at the campus department level. Re: reserves, under new guidance from the CO there is a minimum percentage to meet for all funds.
- **Jackson Wilson** was shocked at slide 27 showing how long campus reserves could support operations in the event of an economic downturn (19 days). Wondered at the trade-offs between increasing reserves vs. using reserves in these times. If continuing to save reserves based on the CSU target of building up to 90 days of reserves, asked what the balance of reducing costs vs. building reserves.
- **Elena Stoian** replied its about shifting department obligation-designation; A&F moved some obligation-designated funds into reserves. Stability in the general operating fund will strengthen campus reserves.
- No further questions received.

#### **Agenda topic – Consultant Services Costs**

- **Jeff Wilson** explained this presentation came from questions asked at the August UBC meeting.
- (see slides)
- **David Hellman** appreciated the transparency by adding descriptions and posting this consultant list publicly. Asked exactly what Huron did for the campus.
- **Jeff Wilson** explained retaining Huron was due to the campus request to the CO for resizing support in lieu of declining enrollment, which the CO agreed to fund. Huron has unique experience helping universities across the country who've encountered this kind of financial environment, primarily in the Northeast, Pennsylvania, Wisconsin. They used tools used at other universities to point towards opportunities for growth and cost savings. Those presentations will continue to be offered at UBC.
- **Brandon Foley** echoed David's comment re: reporting publicly what consultants do and stated concern there isn't a database of consultant spending, which seems discretionary. Asked if there is university policy on when is appropriate/advisable to use university funding for consultants, what the process is for renewing contracts and how consultant success is determined.
- **Jeff Wilson** confirmed the database does exist but it doesn't identify specific payments for consulting services; it's based on accounting structures and payments just need to be identified specifically for this purpose of presentation. There is no policy about using consultants – the responsibility of managing those operations is in the division or college staff who monitor those functions. Anything that rises above a certain dollar threshold is elevated to a vice president or president before those engagements can be pursued.
- **Brandon Foley** asked if consultant fees are known before they rise to VP level for approval.
- **Jeff Wilson** agreed to get that information for him.
- **Robert Collins** asked if there been consideration of creating a consultation "cadre" to do some of the work consultants do to be done by faculty. Although confidentiality issues may be at play, some time ago there were consultation cadres of faculty to do this kind of work which led to cost savings. The buyout is much cheaper than consultants but most importantly, a level of expertise at an academic level that may be more informative than what some consultants can do.
- **Jeff Wilson** replied it had not been considered. Building out/integrating expertise on campus into these types of challenges faced is something that should be considered.

- **Alesha Sohler** asked what proportion was paid to Huron by the CO/allocated to SFSU for Huron.
- **Jeff Wilson** replied it was the full \$455,000.
- **Jackson Wilson** expressed this level of transparency has been requested throughout the system and this is a remarkable example. Asked if consultant costs charged to the campus by the CO for specific purposes are included in this report.
- **Jeff Wilson** responded these are direct consulting contracts with the campus, except for Huron.
- **Anjali Billa** added re: consultants used for Development (within University Advancement); they have internal experts, but with a very small team and when objective advice is needed, they seek external sources as it's difficult to receive objective opinions about the campus from within it.
- **Amy Sueyoshi** added Academic Affairs (AA) evaluates whether a consultant is needed, including for searches.
- **Mari Hulick** clarified the slide shows OHO charges for several years but a year was skipped (2023-2024).
- **Jeff Wilson** confirmed they were hired for three years.
- **Mari Hulick** explained she's wary of consultants because they can be contracted for years when funds can be better spent on classes, staff, facilities, etc. Inquired how much money the CO made available for such services like rebranding, and cautioned re: moving too fast to bring on consultants even when the CO offers it. Faculty have expertise on these topics, such as some in her department who worked for an international branding agency that could have been consulted with course release. There were reports in Inside Higher Ed about Huron's work with UWisconsin and how much they spent. Wonders how there is so much extra funding at the CO to hire that many consultants. Re: bias, everyone has it – including the consultants for their contracts while faculty may be biased for their students, which is good.
- **Craig Relyea** added as the new AVP for Strategic Marketing & Communications he also appreciates the transparency and having worked on large website centralization projects like this, advised they need external teams to help manage the hundreds of urls, etc. Recommended ways to determine which front-end and back-end processes may help evaluate the need.
- **Mary Menees** asked about Blue Beyond as they are not listed.
- **Jeff Wilson** noted they were used in earlier years. He also didn't add consulting contracts under \$30K.
- No further questions received.

#### Agenda topic – Institutional Resilience Project: Workforce

- **Ingrid Williams** shared a review of the work done with Huron for strategic workforce realignment.
- (see slides)
- **Danny Paz Gabriner** asked about areas that need investment (admissions, financial aid) and if there's a plan to increase the number of positions to get them up to benchmark. If so, how this fits into the budget plan.
- **Ingrid Williams** replied she'll be meeting with Katie Lynch for a better understanding of which positions are needed to help them move forward to support increasing enrollment.
- **Robert Collins** shared that crisis creates change and it's necessary to adapt for best practices and service delivery (such as iLearn to Canvas). Asked re: best practices at SFSU: what's working, what's not.
- **Ingrid Williams** affirmed the committee is reviewing learning and development so employees have the skills needed to continue to do the work that needs to get done to adjust to the coming changes.

- **Kendra Van Cleave** commented it's important to reward people and it doesn't have to be financial. Glad that learning and development is being considered. Some are feeling burnt out, and it's helpful to meaningfully mentor and reward those working hard to keep encouraging them.
- **Mike Goldman** asked how many staff and administrators have been lost, the cost of onboarding/ replacing them and what's being done to retain employees.
- **Ingrid Williams** offered to review how many employees left over the past year due to retirement or other reasons. Employee counts will be part of a dashboard she's working on so the information can be easily found.
- Emphasized the university wants to retain its staff. In any employee decrease there's likely institutional knowledge lost along the way so everyone should help document what's needed.
- Some work that's been done over years is not necessary anymore and some job descriptions are out of date, so there's a lot to review and avoid redundancies. These times require change, acknowledging culture change can be hard. Has heard employees remark they've worked here 25+ years and with that much time invested in the institution, they may not want to work differently and may consider retirement in coming years. However, those extra years may not be possible as the work has to change and everyone has to stretch and get creative about their work. Has heard from some that morale is low, but sometimes that comes with change.
- **Katie Murphy** commented the university has talked about trying to meet the staff budget through attrition. Asked what the plan is for attrition in positions really needed or in specific areas; what is being done to adapt the workforce to fit those vacancies.
- **Ingrid Williams** restated they're reviewing vacancies and critical areas that are understaffed. Human Resources sends emails with learning resources to help employees upskill. The committee reviews contracts and classifications ensuring there's no violation when wanting to give individuals other work. There are also individuals on campus that could be better utilized in other areas.
- **Katie Murphy** added the hope that MPP's are part of the review process. Also, if employees don't know what their new assignment might be, then they don't know what training they may need
- **Ingrid Williams** appreciated this point noting they're asking supervisors to meet with employees during the performance evaluation period and should be looking at the job descriptions, to see what's necessary to help develop their staff. Performance evaluations happen only once a year but those conversations should be happening more often.
- No further questions received.

#### **Agenda topic – Institutional Resilience Project: Student Retention**

- **Katie Lynch** introduced this Huron project as an analysis on student retention and the impact it has on the campus budget. Tied together with the development of a new strategic plan, the analysis provided percentages where retention can be improved to understand the real financial impact. The focus will be on undergraduate students in first, second and junior year.
- (see slides)
- **Savi Malik** asked where Metro is in the "What We're Doing" document and their efforts of supporting increases in retention, particularly for first and second year students.
- **Katie Lynch** replied she can add Metro. Added Savi is on the Retention Operations Committee to tie Metro's work more closely into overall efforts to build on the success Metro established.

- **Savi Malik** added Metro has been a bit separated from the larger university and it would be good to continue their collaboration with the Retention Ops Committee, helping the university as a whole.
- **Katie Murphy** asked if there had been any data on what motivates students to physically come to campus, as there's typically a drop in class attendance around this time.
- **Katie Lynch** replied the data goes in different directions about what drives students' motivation to come to campus, and cost and accessibility is one. Shared gratitude for the partnership with Clipper for making access to public transit more opportunistic for students. It's about faculty creating connections with students - are classes engaging, do they want to come and learn, are they eager to work in groups, are there experiences they receive here that helps drive that engagement. Does the library have a vibe where students want to sit, study and drink coffee together, are campus eateries open and accessible, are there spaces where students can work together. These are the kinds of questions to ask. Encouraged all to connect with Fred Smith to see the new Diversity, Equity and Community Inclusion Center in the Student Services Building where they've created a new space integrating the centers in a way that has increased student engagement. There have to be ways to expand on that. Has always enjoyed the vibe of the first couple weeks of school and wonders what happens after the fifth, sixth and seventh week that changes that excitement. Anything that can be done to make sure those connections to campus are being formed helps them stay motivated to come back.
- **Jace Allen** asked to keep in mind in these efforts to dovetail into the way that systems work. For example, last year the calendar of production was increased by 2 weeks to allow students greater time to register. While on the surface is a good thing, it also moved up the timeline for Chairs to have their schedules produced so they're potentially working outside of their regular work time over summer. It helps to review the greater dovetailing with other aspects of strategic planning to make sure Chairs aren't placed in those kinds of situations so systems aren't buckling under that pressure of making those great changes for students.
- No further comments received.

#### **Agenda topic – UBC Workgroups**

- **Jeff Wilson** stated based on feedback from Office Hours, the UBC Steering Committee will restart work groups for this year: Alternative Revenue: those to seek alternative sources of revenue to support the university's operations. Also Chargeback/Cost Recovery and the UBC Charge update. These work groups will bring these items back to the full UBC.
- (see slide)

#### **Agenda topic – Public Forum**

- No questions received.

#### **Co-Chairs adjourned the meeting approximately 11:47 AM.**

- Next UBC meeting: Thursday, October 23, 2025 from 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM via Zoom

-end (nrg)

#### **From the Chat:**

10:00:10 From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist) to Everyone: Good Morning!

10:03:20 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her) to Everyone: Good morning everyone and happy Friday eve!

10:03:24 From Katie Murphy: Did anyone else see the baby raccoons near the old gym today?

10:03:31 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): Morning all!

10:03:35 From Member Rob K Collins: Good morning!

10:04:17 From Kimmie Tsui: Good morning! 🌞

10:04:24 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): @Nancy Ganner Your music selection has me bopping to the beat 😊

10:04:31 From Marisa Jimison: Good morning

10:04:49 From Eileene Tejada, Associate Dean, (she/ella): Good morning!

10:04:54 From Cynthia Tam: Good morning everyone!

10:06:08 From Rick Harvey: Replying to "Did anyone else see the baby raccoons near the old...": Yes, and they were also near the old green house near HSS/BUS/SCI blogs.

10:06:40 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): I urge all faculty and staff to come to "Office Hours" Your feedback is essential, especially now.

10:07:03 From Danny Paz Gabriner: I agree! Come to Office Hours to talk more about the budget! Tomorrow at 11am

10:11:39 From Aaron Kerner - Director of the School of Cinema: So if the CSU doesn't take the loan, does that mean that the 3% cut is back on the table?

10:14:33 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi: @Aaron Kerner - Director of the School of Cinema The 3% reduction is based on how far we are from our target.

10:16:30 From Ryan Howell: Not all enrollments in all departments are down, but sections are still cut. Students are really confused by that.

10:17:16 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): The social media messaging has been greatly improving!!!

10:17:55 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": It has been eye-catching in the best way ❤️

10:17:57 From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist): Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": What platforms are we on? I think we're on IG, FB, and anything else?

10:18:05 From Member David Hellman: A succinct and uniformed message template would help. Something that could be passed along by members etc.

10:18:07 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": I see it on fb the most

10:18:09 From Matt Itelson: Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": LinkedIn for the win!

10:18:12 From Nick Curry: Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": LinkedIn

10:18:17 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": Also linkdn

10:18:24 From Matt Itelson: Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": We aren't posting on X/Twitter anymore.

0:19:01 From Member, Katie Lynch (she/her/hers): Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": SMC is working on a strategy to expand our platforms this year! It is very exciting and our students are involved!

10:19:08 From Christine Hintermann: Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": are we on Bluesky?

10:19:12 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "A succinct and uniformed message template would he...": Top 5 talking points..

10:19:23 From Matt Itelson: Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": @Christine Hintermann not yet. We have a Threads account.

10:19:37 From Chris Bettinger: I love the idea of building. But building in the context of cuts often triggers a war of all against all since every dollar for building exacerbates cuts. Any ideas on how to avoid that?

10:19:54 From Christine Hintermann: Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": @Matt going to add it to my account.

10:20:14 From Member, Katie Lynch (she/her/hers): Replying to "A succinct and uniformed message template would he...": This is in development and will be available for all, based on roles, by January in time for our yield season.

10:20:29 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": @Christine Hintermann same! Going to add now

10:20:46 From Eileene Tejada, Associate Dean, (she/ella): @Chris Bettinger, we can collaborate instead of competing for resources. We are in it together.

10:20:53 From patrick mcfall: classes are available. They just need to be willing to take early classes

10:21:02 From Matt Itelson: Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": A TikTok is in the plans, too.

10:21:06 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "The social media messaging has been greatly improv...": @Katie Lynch (she/her/hers) It has been super noticeable! It looks amazing

10:21:11 From Member, Mary Menees: SF State is deeply embedded in SF. I had to call the paramedics on Tuesday for my neighbor. (He is ok) After I mentioned I work at SF State, one the EMTs told me his finance just transferred from city college and they are so excited to be at SF State!

10:21:13 From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist): I want to give kudos to Dr. Susanna Jones for coordinating this year's AU 110: Living in San Francisco fieldtrip. Because it is, as a friend of mine put it "great for students to orient themselves in the context of the city. I could see how the class invites students to think of SF as a larger classroom to study and interpret, and interact with meaningfully."

10:21:19 From Danny Paz Gabriner: Replying to "classes are available. They just need to be willin...": Not all classes are available for the requirements students need

10:22:02 From Member, Katie Lynch (she/her/hers): Replying to "I want to give kudos to Dr. Susanna Jones for coor...": The students who enrolled (nearly 400) had such a great time that they want to start a student club with one another to keep exploring the city

10:22:06 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi: Replying to "classes are available. They just need to be willin...": If there are students who cannot take required classes, please send them my way.

10:22:06 From Ryan Howell: Budget allocations must follow the student enrollments. Honestly, that is harder ask than it sounds, but that has to be the end we are working towards. The budget model would have completely different than it is now.

10:22:37 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "I want to give kudos to Dr. Susanna Jones for coor...": @Katie Lynch (she/her/hers) I love this idea! This wold have been amazing when I was a freshman at SFSU wayyyyyy back in the day

10:22:48 From Katie Murphy: Replying to "classes are available. They just need to be willin...": Have there been any studies on what can motivate commuter students to come to campus early in the morning? Or what can motivate non-commuters to wake up early?

10:23:22 From Bob Bonner: Related to the conversation: <https://online.hbs.edu/blog/post/ambidextrous-organization>

10:23:25 From patrick mcfall: Students have gotten use to having the option of taking classes on line. If we remove the option, they will be forced to do in person

10:23:54 From Matt Itelson: Replying to "I want to give kudos to Dr. Susanna Jones for coor...": Read more about the AU 110 Living in Frisco class! <https://news.sfsu.edu/news/your-sfsu-crash-course-san-francisco-living>

10:24:19 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": Or they will go somewhere else that gives them options

10:25:01 From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist): Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": My work study staff prefer in person classes. They find it more engaging.

10:25:19 From Leyla Ozsen: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": Do we have data on this either way? For example, does SJSU whose enrollment has increased offer a mix of course modalities?

10:25:39 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": Different students prefer different modalities. We need to be limber.

10:26:24 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": @Mari Hulick (she/her) and for different reasons!

10:26:43 From Ryan Howell: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": Psychology students overall prefer a mix of modalities (in-person, hybrid, hyflex, online [and modalities within this]). We have faculty think about how best their class can be offered an try to balance from there.

10:27:24 From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist): Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": I think another aspect of this is whether they can find jobs on campus, be it work study or student assistant or a paid internship. Do we have data on what we offer?

10:27:30 From Janet Remolona: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": @Gabriela My WS students also prefer in-person. They actually dropped a recommended class when they enrolled and found out it was online.

10:28:45 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": @Leyla Ozsen I did survey the provosts about WFH, and one third responded. All those campuses had already moved to 4 days on campus and all of them had increased enrollments. We can't say its causal but we can see there is a correlation.

10:29:39 From Leyla Ozsen: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": It's difficult to engage students in job opportunities, networking events, and the broader city community when we provide only limited in-person course offerings.

10:31:24 From patrick mcfall: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": when we are looking at engagement, being in person is best for active engagement. We have gotten use to being connected to technology and with AI and chat GPT, we are losing our ability to think organically. Online became necessary due to covid. however, there are social skills that can only be learned by being in person.

10:35:34 From Aaron Kerner - Director of the School of Cinema: What is the Creative Arts Building loan? Loan for what? This is the first time I'm hearing of such a thing.

10:36:10 From Bob Bonner: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": We should be thinking in terms of the category of schools. It's hard to compare campuses because, as Mari noted, campuses vary in their actual physical location which means the external analyses will be very different. If we are a

*commuter campus, our modalities should be designed to accommodate commuter students. We can't have "ought" strategies because students will just leave if they feel like we aren't accessible.*

*10:36:38 From Member Michael Scott: The University took a loan to add a fourth floor to Marcus Hall.*

*10:37:02 From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist): Replying to "The University took a loan to add a fourth floor t...": Is that information detailed in a section/tab here? <https://cpdc.sfsu.edu/>*

*10:40:06 From Matt Itelson: Replying to "The University took a loan to add a fourth floor t...": The fourth floor of Marcus Hall is where the College of LCA dean's office is located. I had an office there for a few months. It's a huge space. There are also a few classrooms on the 4th floor.*

*10:41:53 From Matt Itelson: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": @patrick mcfall ICYMI: <https://time.com/7295195/ai-chatgpt-google-learning-school/>*

*10:42:08 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): Replying to "The University took a loan to add a fourth floor t...": The project was years in the making. There is a history that somehow has something to do with the Mashouf Wellness Center using the funds that were initially earmarked for an expansion of LCA. They cobbled the final funds for Marcus from a number of sources.*

*10:42:53 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): When is the Chancellor's Office going to give us a half a million to run our programs?*

*10:43:23 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Replying to "When is the Chancellor's Office going to give us a...": Also, how many of the campuses had these "services" assigned to them?*

*10:43:26 From Member Danny Paz Gabriner: Replying to "When is the Chancellor's Office going to give us a...": What about an extra half a million from the reserves?*

*10:44:32 From Leyla Ozsen: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": These days, people tend to look at the value of higher education through job placement. But both career readiness and soft skill development really happen when students take advantage of campus resources. From what we've seen over the past five years, when most courses were online, enrollment actually went down. That makes me hesitant to think staying fully on that path is the right move.*

*10:44:58 From Member Michael Scott: ORSP uses PEER consulting to provide special expertise in support of the Institutional Review Board*

*10:45:19 From Member Michael Scott: IRB oversee humans subjects research*

*10:45:27 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": No one is arguing for fully online. We are however, urging flexibility.*

*10:45:33 From Bob Bonner: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": We have to be cognizant of what is going on in the information channels our students use whether it's accurate or not, it's how many of them make decisions [https://www.reddit.com/r/SFSU/comments/1mos17g/ohhhh\\_lord/](https://www.reddit.com/r/SFSU/comments/1mos17g/ohhhh_lord/)*

*10:45:38 From Member Michael Scott: Its a senate committee*

10:46:39 From Bob Bonner: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": "Wow !! Just ran the numbers... between parking, gas, and tolls, it's going to cost me \$4,200 per semester just to get to campus for a 1-hour class twice a week. That's basically paying double tuition one to SFSU and one to Chevron & Caltrains. BS 🙄🙄" - This is what people see online on Reddit.

10:46:39 From patrick mcfall: Replying to "The University took a loan to add a fourth floor t...": it is my understanding that we receive money for having students actually in class. How do we promote the value to being in person as a vital component to the learning experience? There has been research done on the learning gap students experienced during covid. How do we utilize that data to develop a new marketing plan to put students in the seats.

10:48:10 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): What is Oology?

10:48:41 From Robyn Ollodort: Replying to "What is Oology?": Ologie, they facilitated the university rebrand

10:49:01 From Member, Venesia Thompson-Ramsay: Replying to "What is Oology?": Mari, it is Ologie and they handle the marketing and branding work for the university

10:49:23 From Ryan Howell: When consultants are hired to perform a service or evaluation is there a requirement or determination that this work cannot be done by faculty at SFSU?

10:49:43 From Member Danny Paz Gabriner: Replying to "When consultants are hired to perform a service or...": or staff!

10:49:44 From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist): Replying to "What is Oology?": <https://brand.sfsu.edu/>

10:50:28 From Leyla Ozsen: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": The replies to that comment suggest otherwise, however. And yes, we need to be cognizant of all students' needs. And perhaps more importantly, we need to make every minute of the in-person class time worth the travel. It's hard for students to see the value of networking, especially first get students and the return on their investment and how engagement translates to better paying jobs. I was a first generation student. It's helpful to connect the dots for them.

10:51:51 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): What proportion of funding, expressed both as a percentage and in absolute dollar terms, was allocated to SFSU for the Huron consulting services?

10:52:34 From Member, Mary Menees: The funding came from the CO

10:53:53 From Member, Katie Lynch (she/her/hers): Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": The Financial Aid team jumped in on this one and helped them calculate the cost which were lower than they were reporting.

10:54:54 From Ryan Howell: Replying to "When consultants are hired to perform a service or...": Hey @Member Rob K Collins see here.

10:55:30 From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist): Replying to "classes are available. They just need to be willin...": @Katie Murphy I wonder this as well. I do know that the things that students who arrive here before 8 am tell me is that they wish there were places open that they can wait in away from the elements, for safety issues, and to study. I believe library hours are 7 am to 11 pm during the active semesters and reduced hours during the summer. I know staffing affected the hours of operation.

10:55:33 From Member, Mary Menees: What is Beyond Blue?

10:55:35 From Jennifer Waller: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": I was also a first generation student with two young kids. I was lucky enough not to have to work at that time, but many of our students have jobs they are juggling to survive, not to mention living in extended family situations. Taking on classes is an incredible endeavor under those circumstances. I would never have taken online classes because I really needed the class time to focus and connect.

10:56:15 From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist): Thank you for this meeting and all the discussion. I have to leave for another meeting.

10:56:46 From Member, Venesia Thompson-Ramsay: Replying to "What is Beyond Blue?": They led the university strategic planning work.

10:57:15 From Anjali Billa: for Advancement i can answer Rob's question. for the kind of recommendations that Huron gave to Development, there was no one else in the University except for the Dev team who could have investigated it. so to get the "expert inputs " we needed industry experts that Huron is. We are good at what we do in Development but there is a LOT we need to accomplish and it was very helpful to get the direction that Huron gave

10:58:39 From Member Christine Hintermann: Consultants don't have the bias that we have

10:59:30 From Member Christine Hintermann: Replying to "Consultants don't have the bias that we have": why we have Academic Senate for shared governance

10:59:34 From Member Rob K Collins: Replying to "for Advancement i can answer Rob's question. for t...": Thank you very much!

11:02:05 From Katie Murphy: Replying to "Consultants don't have the bias that we have": Unfortunately, consultants come with their own set of biases.

11:02:18 From Isabel Seiden: Replying to "Consultants don't have the bias that we have": Generally a pro-hiring-more-consultants bias.

11:02:22 From Craig Relyea: I can speak to OHO specifically if needed

11:02:59 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/quick-takes/2024/12/17/report-u-wisconsin-system-paid-huron-51m-2019-23>

11:05:36 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi : Craig is our new AVP of strategic marketing and communications

11:05:48 From Shawn Hicks SFSU/ITS: +1 @Craig Relyea

11:05:57 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): I did say you need an outside firm for a website like ours. The question is, "Which outside firm?"

11:06:07 From Member Alex Hwu (he/him/his) - Member: Most consultants do provide resources that most of us can do internally. They also have significant amount of expertise to help us finding options and solutions

11:06:38 From Ryan Howell: In the eyes of transparency, are there SOWs signed with various consultants—which outline the goals, the rationale for the spend, the deliverables, and an evaluation of the ROI on the spend? If so, may we see them?

11:06:42 From Member Chanda Jensen: In regards to transparency - I hear that there is a committee has been formed to study graduation on this campus. I would like to see a presentation at UBC regarding the costs associated to having our graduations at the SF Giants Ball Park

11:07:05 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): Yes @Member Alex Hwu (he/him/his) - Member. The problem is, there are others who are in the business of making money. Period

11:07:34 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Thank you, VP Wilson!

11:08:18 From Anjali Billa: Thank you VP Wilson!

11:08:19 From Member Alex Hwu (he/him/his) - Member: Replying to "Yes @Member Alex Hwu (he/him/his) - Member. The pr...": Personally I am really impressed with Huron

11:08:36 From Member Christine Hintermann: Replying to "Consultants don't have the bias that we have": Not all Consultants, but it prevents tax payers and the media to spin it as conflict of interest too. Recall the Academic Senate exist where folks can be proactive in process vs reactive and avoidant of the reality.

11:08:39 From Nancy Ganner: we'll come back at 11:13am

11:09:18 From Matt Itelson: Replying to "In regards to transparency - I hear that a committee...": I have heard it is also expensive to put on Commencement in the SFSU Cos Stadium. They have to bring in a jumbotron and thousands of chairs, for example.

11:10:36 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi: Replying to "In regards to transparency - I hear that a committee..." Yes we can do a presentation of costs as their evaluation solidifies!

11:14:09 From Member David Hellman: Anyone else getting weird audio issues?

11:14:31 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi: Replying to "Anyone else getting weird audio issues?": no

11:16:21 From Bob Bonner: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": To be clear, I don't think we should be a fully online campus, ha. I am also a first gen who benefitted from in-person classes. But we should be careful using individual level logics to make macro-level strategic decisions when external environments have shifted significantly since COVID. We should let the data help us formulate our strategies. When we offer online, hybrid, and face-to-face sections, the online courses and hybrid fill up. Inability to provide good hybrid or online experiences for the students who need it is a separate issue lol But otherwise, we should be open to ambidexterity, different strategies for different opportunities within the same entity.

11:17:15 From Larry Birello (SF State): Replying to "In regards to transparency - I hear that a committ...": The urban legend is that it originally cost \$200K MORE to have it at SF State than at Oracle Park.

11:18:20 From Member Michael Scott: Replying to "In regards to transparency - I hear that a committ...": Cox is also very unfriendly for people with mobility issues

11:18:41 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi: Replying to "In regards to transparency - I hear that a committ...": Cox is actually not ADA compliant.

11:19:44 From Ryan Howell: Replying to "Students have gotten use to having the option of t...": Preach @Bob Bonner

11:21:01 From Member Elena Stoian: Replying to "When is the Chancellor's Office going to give us a...": The CO is very instrumental in helping with one time funding - in supporting our depreciated facilities, which we no longer have it as an ongoing budget line.....more than 0.5 mil /yr. This way we don't have to draw down our reserves.

11:24:10 From Member Elena Stoian: Replying to "Most consultants do provide resources that most of...": Specially with limited resources and time.

11:31:45 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): Replying to "In regards to transparency - I hear that a committ...": Send this to Steering Committee and ask it to be placed on an agenda.

11:39:45 From Kendra Van Cleave: How do we reward people for stretching? (Financially or not)

11:40:10 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): One of the things we could do is bring back the User Friendly Campus Principles - Make these front and center. <https://hr.sfsu.edu/p530c>

11:40:24 From Kendra Van Cleave: Replying to "How do we reward people for stretching? (Financial...": Great to hear you're looking at that! 😊

11:41:02 From Matt Itelson: Replying to "One of the things we could do is bring back the Us...": @Member Mari Hulick (she/her) You are so on point today!

11:41:33 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): Replying to "One of the things we could do is bring back the Us...": Thank you @Matt Itelson, I've been meditating.

11:43:20 From Member David Hellman: Replying to "How do we reward people for stretching? (Financial...": We need to incentivize "stretching" or people will opt not to and just do the status quo amount of work.

11:44:35 From Sandra Henao: Replying to "I did say you need an outside firm for a website l...": Was the website project put out for bid?

11:45:02 From Alexis Lowry: Replying to "I did say you need an outside firm for a website l...": Yes

11:47:04 From Member Danny Paz Gabriner: <https://sfsu.app.box.com/s/xa3kmicgvcjzdon7qsf100j5mvn2y2ia>

11:47:11 From Member David Hellman: I think it is great to see these "real" examples of how Huron consulting has benefited the campus. This is the information stakeholders on campus need to see, so they don't think those funds are wasted or ill used.

11:49:03 From co-chair Jeff Wilson: Replying to "I think it is great to see these "real" examples o...": These examples continue through November UBC meeting.

11:49:33 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi: Replying to "I think it is great to see these "real" examples o...": Our work groups will continue to present!

11:50:15 From Member Michael Goldman: Nice work!

11:50:29 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): We're all hungry.

11:53:40 From Member David Hellman: The Library has awesome vibes!!!

11:53:40 From Member Danny Paz Gabriner: Metro's 1 year retention among 1st year students was 9% higher than students outside of the program! Among other impressive stats.

11:53:48 From Kendra Van Cleave: The library is really working on creating that kind of "vibe"! We've got new spaces including The Family Study Room, where people can study with kids (and there are kid activity kits), as well as The Living Room, which is a more lounge-y space

11:54:25 From Kendra Van Cleave: Replying to "The library is really working on creating that kin..." PLUS an actual "Silent Study" room for those who need NO NOISE 🙄

11:54:41 From Rick Harvey: Thanks to Save, Danny and all of Metro for the impressive work regarding retention.

11:54:46 From co-chair Amy Sueyoshi: SF Chronicle reports that the city generally is having difficulty getting students K-12 to come to class, which means we might need to work extra hard at belonging.

11:54:58 From Rick Harvey: Savi

11:55:04 From Member Michael Scott: Replying to "The library is really working on creating that kin...": 3rd and 4th floor is also now open in the evenings! Much nicer space than research and study commons

11:55:43 From Member Alex Hwu (he/him/his) - Member: Yes

11:55:48 From Sandra Henao: Replying to "Metro's 1 year retention among 1st year students w...": Are Metro services delivered to students mostly online, mostly in-person or hybrid?

11:56:28 From Member Danny Paz Gabriner: Replying to "Metro's 1 year retention among 1st year students w...": Mostly we are in person, although we have some remote services and some of our students do also take online classes.

11:57:37 From Member Jackson Wilson (he, him, his): Speaking of retention... there is a bucking bull ride and blow up obstacle race/slide in the Quad. 🐮 Thank you

*11:57:49 From Member Danny Paz Gabriner: Come to Office Hours tomorrow at 11am if you want to get your questions heard or discuss budget! Email [ubc@sfsu.edu](mailto:ubc@sfsu.edu)*

*11:57:50 From Member Alesha Sohler (She/Her): Thank you to all the presenters!*

*11:57:50 From Afitap Boz: Thank you!*

*11:57:56 From Member Mari Hulick (she/her): Thanks everybody*

*11:57:58 From Member Rob K Collins: Thank you!*

*11:58:00 From Grover Rudolph: Thanks all*

*11:58:00 From Member Jamillah Moore: Thank you*