



University Budget Committee Meeting Minutes

Date: Thursday, February 10, 2022

Location: via Zoom

Members Present: Voting members present: CFO & VP Jeff Wilson, Co-Chair, and Provost & VP Jennifer Summit, Co-Chair, VP Jeff Jackanicz, VP Jamillah Moore, VP Jason Porth, Dean Eugene Sivadas, Jennifer Daly, Mary Menees, Dylan Mooney, , Evrim Ozer, Renee Stephens, Nancy Gerber, Akm Newaz, Gitanjali Shahani, Genie Stowers, Senate Chair Teddy Albinak, SIC Chair Michael Goldman, ASCSU FGA Liaison Darlene Yee-Melichar. Non-voting members present: President Lynn Mahoney, Elena Stoian, Dwayne Banks, Katie Lynch, Cesar Mozo, Sandee Noda, Mirel Tikkanen, Venesia Thompson-Ramsey, Tammie Ridgell, Jamil Sheared, Deborah Elia.

Members Absent: A.S. President Joshua Ochoa, AS VP of Finance, Nia Hall, Jaime Haymond, James Martel, Lark Winner, UAPD rep

Committee Staff Present: Liesl Violante, Catherine Kim (Human Resources)

Guests Present: (list of all guests furnished upon request)

Accompanying presentation to view concurrently can be found here: [UBC Presentation February 10, 2022](#)

UBC co-chairs called this meeting to order at approximately 10:03 A.M.

Agenda topic # 1 – Welcome from Co-Chairs

- **Jennifer Summit** and **Jeff Wilson** welcomed committee members and guests..
- Guests were reminded of the ways to contact UBC and upcoming Office Hours.
- **Jeff Wilson** thanked Nancy Ganner for her six years of service to the UBC. Liesl Violante will be replacing her moving forward.

Agenda topic # 2 – member roll call and membership change

- Noted absent members: Teddy Albinak, Nia Hall, Jaime Haymond, Lark Winner

Agenda topic # 3 – Approval of minutes from November 18, 2021 meeting

- **Jeff Wilson** requested approval of meeting minutes.
- **Darlene Yee-Melichar** requested corrections and corrections were made.
- Motion for approval made, seconded, passed.

Agenda topic # 4 – President’s Message

- Acknowledgement of everyone’s work to enable remote operations and learning for the first few weeks of the semester.
- CSU budget advocacy period update of \$304 million in new funding fell woefully short of the ask amount. California state budget is looking at a multi-billion-dollar surplus that could be applied to 20-30 years of academic infrastructure neglect.
 - Met with several local electives and will be meeting with Phil Ting and Kevin McCarthy from the Budget Committee for the most ambitious ask in the history of the CSU system for an additional \$381 million in

recurring general fund and \$900 million in one-time funds. Met with Senators Becker and Wiener and Assembly Member Levine who are very supportive.

- Students Joshua Ochoa and Koreena joined the meeting and advocated for fair and competitive compensation for CSU faculty and employees as a first priority. They relayed how important it is for the CSU to attract and retain the best faculty and staff.
- The second priority is to address the equity gap. Advocated for the need to hire more faculty who reflect the backgrounds and experiences of CSU undergraduates as well as the re-enrollment campaign to bring back and retain students. The academic infrastructure needs were presented with a tour of Thornton and Hensill Halls. The tour and meetings were hopeful with support evident in the Capitol.
- Advocacy work will continue with the statewide Academic Senate as well as all other organizations who are advocating for the same message. There is also a push for the basic needs for students as well as affordable student housing and state supportive housing and a very healthy state budget so getting the message out collectively would be helpful. May to July will be the time to see what the governor has promised.

Agenda topic # 5 – Transparency Topic: IRA Fees

(see slides 10-27)

- **Jeff Wilson** introduced this topic about instructional activity fees funding allocation.
- **Jamillah Moore** presented a history overview of IRA at SF State local policies and standards, IRA dollars and supported programs and services with the process to request IRA dollars for programs and services.
- **Michael Goldman** asked about the decrease in project funding of 70% over two years and how that matches the student enrollment decrease and if the IRA reflects the same decrease or are they fixed.
- **Jamillah Moore** said she would connect with her team and get back with the information.
- **Nancy Gerber** agreed with Michael Goldman's questions about why the fees decreased over 50% but the enrollment did not.
- **Nancy Gerber** asked about the large distribution to the library versus the other smaller funding areas and who makes the decision about the distribution break down. Does the IRA Committee make the decision and how often do they meet to review?
- **Jamillah Moore** deferred to **Provost Summit** who explained that the library acquisition for direct student use is proportionate to the total amount received for library collections for student use and curriculum with the idea of saving student's money for adding library materials they would otherwise have to purchase.
- **Nancy Gerber** requested more information about the distribution process IRA fees and how the decisions are made.
- **Genie Stowers** asked if athletics and campus recreation draw from the IRA fees or are they funded by another source?
- **Jamillah Moore** responded that athletics receives some fees but also supports itself through the fees they charge.
- **Dylan Mooney** does the IRA board allocate money for maintenance and facilities of athletic and academic shared spaces?
- **Jamillah Moore** responded that no, there is no allocation for maintenance and facilities only projects.
- **Jennifer Daly** asked for the link to who is serving on the IRA Committee, and also what kind of projects are funded out of the IRA fees, how and when are the decisions made on what to fund, and when can feedback be given for that decision making process?

- **Jamillah Moore** responded that this is a conversation for the IRA board who sets projects and departments should add those requests to their proposals.
- **Joshua Ochoa** serves on the IRA advisory board and commented that it appears the library gets a specific amount instead of a percentage of the fee, but asked if there is a way to change the proportions given to academic projects and the library to be based on a percentage instead of a set amount.
- **Jamillah Moore** process change for allocation would be needed and decided by academic affairs.
- **Provost Summit** mentioned that it is not a set amount and changes from year to year. This process should be reviewed.
- **Jerry Shapiro** commented on athletics fundraising activities brought in money to support scholarships. It is recommended that Stephanie offer a presentation as the Director of Athletics.
- **Jamillah Moore** offered a final comment about the advisory board looks at opportunities to provide digital platforms when print journals are not available.

Agenda topic # 6 – Presentation: 2022-23 Budget Planning

(see slides 29-41)

- **Jeff Wilson** introduced the 2022-23 budget planning update to be given by Elena Stoian, Executive Director of Budget Administration & Operations.
- **Elena Stoian** presented on the budget planning process update for 2022-23.
- **Nancy Gerber** asked about student housing grant program and if it will provide money as direct support to the students so that they can purchase housing or providing funds to the university to develop more housing.
- **Jeff Wilson** explained that the California Affordable Student Housing (CASH) program is targeted to support the construction of affordable housing at the CSU and community college campuses. \$500 million was allocated for the current year and the governor has proposed \$750 million for 2022-23. The funding didn't address student vouchers.
- **Michael Goldman** asked for more information on the 50% reduction in the cost of instructional materials.
- **Elena Stoian** explained the plan from the governor was to help reduce the cost of instruction by 50% but did not mention how and how to be measured. Elena will provide more details as she receives them.

Agenda topic # 7 – Presentation: Graduate Enrollment Trends

(see slides 43-62)

- **Sophie Clavier**, Dean of Graduate Studies presented on graduate enrollment trends.
- **Gitanjali Shahani** asked if the belief of converting some programs into online offerings to raise enrollment and save some programs has been seen in graduate trends across education generally.
- **Sophie Clavier** mentioned that many graduate programs need a lab and face-to-face approach for active participation in research. Some programs that do not require hands on experience, but online offerings need a discussion on how best to leverage technology and provide flexibility for working students with research on effectiveness. Online services for graduate students has been very successful over the last two years.
- **Nancy Gerber** asked if we have data on how well the blended programs are working and do they boost enrollment?
- **Sophie Clavier** scholars program update at the end of this year should show the effectiveness in data. 35 programs are expected.
- **Dylan Mooney** asked if there is capacity for non-academic support such as advising and administrative processing if graduate programs increased enrollment.

- **Sophie Clavier** mentioned that support services and staffing are needed for all students but feels confident that there is capacity to support the growth.
- **Genie Stowers** pointed out the need for explicit discussion, decision making, and breakdown of funding and resources for programs that have both an undergraduate and graduate component. Also requesting the capacity studies that could be very useful.
- **Akm Newaz** asked if there is a way the graduate division can support graduate studies in CoSE to help with tuition scholarship, increase in faculty for research and other creative works.

Agenda topic # 8 – Updates/Informational Item: HEERF update

(see slides 64-73)

- **Jay Orendorff**, AVP for Business Operations presented the latest update on the HEERF funding projects.
- **Genie Stowers** asked when classroom renovations will begin and what amount will not be encumbered by the deadline.
- **Jay Orendorff** will work with Avinash, Interim AVP for Facilities to get an update on classroom renovation status. We're projecting right now to be \$700,000 over committed since some projects such as COVID testing went over their initial projections.
- **Mary Menees** asked if there was a possibility the deadline will be extended
- **Jay Orendorff** replied there may be an extension, but the goal is finish up before summer.
- **Mary Menees** asked if unspent funds will be moved to lost revenue.
- **Jay Orendorff** replied that this is still undecided but in discussion.

Agenda topic # 9 – Presentation: Technology Governance Committee update

(see slides 48-55)

- **Jeff Wilson** introduced the new shared Technology Governance Committee to be presented by Nish Malik, Andrew Roderick, and Shawn Hicks.
- **Nish Malik** gave a brief overview of the Technology Governance Committee.
- **Michael Goldman** asked who can speak to computer use in research and research support centers as well as registrar computational needs. Where would people go to get questions answered in those areas.
- **Andrew Roderick** explained the steering committee and also the academic technology advisory committee, which is an academic affairs advisory committee would be able to represent larger strategic needs in these areas.
- **Nish Malik** explained the subcommittees would represent each area and bring to the steering committee for a broader discussion at the strategic level, and if needed, be brought to the attention of the president's cabinet.
- **Dylan Mooney** asked how the steering committee and subcommittees will be/are populated with diverse representation of stakeholders from across the campus and expressed concern that the steering committee looks extremely administration heavy.
- **Nish Malik** clarified which subcommittees are new and already in existence and explained there is a charge to revisit these committees and look at charters and membership for proper representation.
- **Andrew Roderick** mentioned part of the work will be figuring out that formula across all of these subcommittees for proper representation of campus stakeholders with the goal of understanding the IT needs of the university from a non-IT perspective.
- **Jennifer Daly** pointed out that representation seems to be mostly MPP's who are not necessarily the user and buyer or those actually doing the work from day to day. What would be the process to incorporate others feedback for decision making.

- **Nish Malik** mentioned they are currently working with Sandee and staff representation on the committee and more to come on committee structure incorporating equal representation in shared governance.
- **Eugene Sivadas** requested a grandfather in moratorium for items that may be in the pipeline so they will not be held up during this development process.
- **Nish Malik** will meet with Jeff and Jennifer to determine how to keep what the university is currently working on moving during the development process of this governance committee.

Agenda topic # 10 – Public Forum

- **Jeff Wilson** opened the public forum.
- **Jerry Shapiro** asked why we couldn't expand capacity where there is demand. Also, asked if data could be provided for the cost per undergraduate and graduate student and gather data on allocation of resources for undergraduate and graduate programs. Also, could data be provided on faculty tenure line track positions and how they have been allocated, how many requests were honored by the granting of positions.
- **Jennifer Summit** replied increasing capacity for undergraduate programs varies by program and recommends working with the Dean to determine how to build capacity. There are costs associated with growing graduate enrollment that must be balanced with the investments required. Faculty hiring is according to student need and enrollment demand that includes both graduate and undergraduate programs. Allocation of scarce resources in order to meet significant student needs remains the priority. Because of our commitment to student success and educational equity, we have to prioritize the enrollment and retention and graduation of our undergraduate students, given the size of that enrollment and the importance of that enrollment to our overall university mission. A strategic enrollment advisory committee is creating a plan and looking at these suggestions and where do we want to be in five to ten years.

Co-Chairs adjourned the meeting approximately 11:03 AM

- Next meeting: Thursday, March 17, 2022, 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM

-end (lv)

FROM THE CHAT:

- From Jason Porth (he/him) to Everyone 09:07 AM
- Thank you Nancy!
- From Eugene Sivadas, member to Everyone 09:07 AM
- Thank you Nancy
- From Member Darlene Yee-Melichar to Everyone 09:08 AM
- Nancy Ganner, we appreciated your able assistance and support for UBC- thank you!
- From Member Darlene Yee-Melichar to Everyone 09:15 AM
- This continuing budget advocacy is so critical-- thanks to President Mahoney and our student leaders for their important work! ASCSU FGA faculty will help with budget advocacy in the coming weeks too. 😊
- From Carmen Domingo to Everyone 09:15 AM
- Thank you President Mahoney for your important advocacy work!
- From Chanda Jensen to Everyone 09:27 AM
- Please double check the amounts for the Athletic Fee. I believe the breakdown is \$58 for Athletics and \$10 for Campus Recreation.
- From S. Evrim Ozer (they/them/theirs) to Everyone 09:35 AM

- Slide 16: CSU Viewpoint Neutrality on Fee Allocation 😊
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 09:36 AM
- That's a problem that might need to be addressed by the Chargeback Committee
- From Christine Hintermann to Everyone 09:37 AM
- Here here, I agree Dylan!
- From Samantha Ward to Everyone 09:37 AM
- Very much agreed, thank you Dylan!
- From Brian Sharber to Everyone 09:38 AM
- Print Journals were disallowed by former president Wong. The preference was to move to digital platforms unless the print is a fundraiser.
- From Mia Reisweber to Everyone 09:38 AM
- https://vpsaem.sfsu.edu/sites/default/files/documents/IRA_Advisory_Board_Roster.pdf
- From Brian Sharber to Everyone 09:39 AM
- The IRA Advisory Board roster is available at vpsaem.sfsu.edu/sfac/ira
- From Jennifer Summit to Everyone 09:40 AM
- the IRA allocation to the library varies from year to year, so it isn't a set amount
- From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist) to Everyone 09:40 AM
- It says, "Page Not Found" when clicking that link.
- From member renee e. stephens to Everyone 09:41 AM
- Thank you Dr. Moore. excellent work. very insightful
- From Joshua Rudy Ochoa to Everyone 09:41 AM
- Thank you!
- From Brian Sharber to Everyone 09:41 AM
- <https://vpsaem.sfsu.edu/instructionally-related-activities-fee>
- From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist) to Everyone 09:41 AM
- Thanks, Brian!
- From member renee e. stephens to Everyone 09:43 AM
- @Jerry...bring back the crab feed via baseball team! yes. our athletes have designated study hall for homework. And ice cream social for recognized high GPA and invited fac mentor :)
- From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) to Everyone 09:57 AM
- Thank you, Elena, for all of this good information!
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 09:57 AM
- Thank you for an informative presentation as always Elena!
- From Me to Everyone 09:57 AM
- If you are a guest and have questions, please note for the public forum at the end of the presentations.
- From Member, Nancy Gerber to Everyone 09:57 AM
- Thanks for the information.
- From Gretchen LeBuhn (she / her) to Everyone 10:00 AM
- That is impressive, Sophie!
- From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) to Everyone 10:03 AM
- So good to get this data out there, Sophie and Noah, to counter the existing narrative that grad is continuing to decline. Thank you!
- From Joshua Rudy Ochoa to Everyone 10:03 AM
- I'm a first year grad student! We love to see this growth!
- From Member Darlene Yee-Melichar to Everyone 10:09 AM
- Thanks to our Grad Studies Division, these innovative enrollment initiatives have been successful in helping grad programs in identifying prospective students!
- From Jennifer Summit to Everyone 10:12 AM

- The graduate division has done an excellent job addressing a long-term decline in graduate enrollment, but it's important as well to understand that graduate enrollment is only 10% of our total enrollment and has declined by 44% since 2013-14
- From Gretchen LeBuhn (she / her) to Everyone 10:14 AM
- Given the shift in demographics in the Bay Area, would increasing grad programs be strategic?
- From Jennifer Summit to Everyone 10:14 AM
- Not if it comes at a cost to our undergrad enrollment, Gretchen
- From Gretchen LeBuhn (she / her) to Everyone 10:16 AM
- At least in Biology, expanding our grad programs has huge benefits for our ability to mentor and teach undergraduates. It isn't a zero sum game.
- From Member, Nancy Gerber to Everyone 10:19 AM
- That's great news.
- From Lori Beth Way to Everyone 10:21 AM
- We now also have more evening advising and tutoring.
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 10:22 AM
- Thank you!
- From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone 10:23 AM
- @Sophie and @Noah, thank you for this important information. This opens up important questions for us all.
- From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone 10:26 AM
- Thanks for your great work, deans Sophie and Noah!
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 10:26 AM
- Jerry had a question
- From Jennifer Summit to Everyone 10:27 AM
- the open forum is available for non-members' questions
- From Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Administrative Analyst/Specialist) to Everyone 10:27 AM
- Good morning! Are any of the slide decks for presentations posted anywhere that we can look at them later? I am quite interested in the presentation by Dr. Sophie Clavier and Noah Price. Thank you to all presenters!
- From Jerry Shapiro, guest to Everyone 10:27 AM
- Hi Jeff,
- From Sophie Clavier, Graduate Studies, Guest to Everyone 10:27 AM
- Thank you for having us
- From Noah Price | Guest to Everyone 10:28 AM
- Thank you everyone.
- From Jerry Shapiro, guest to Everyone 10:28 AM
- I would appreciate the opportunity to speak to graduate enrollment...I asked to be recognised
- From Jeff Wilson to Everyone 10:29 AM
- Of course, Jerry. The open forum will start after the final agenda item.
- From Member, Jennifer Daly to Everyone 10:30 AM
- Hi Gabriella - the PowerPoint will be posted at <https://adminfin.sfsu.edu/ubc>
- From Jerry Shapiro, guest to Everyone 10:30 AM
- My comments were specific and relevant to the material Sophie presented
- From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone 10:30 AM
- @ Jay, when will the Classroom Renovations begin? It appeared that none of that money has been used, but I just caught it as the slide went by.
- From Guest - Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Admin Analyst/Specialist) to Everyone 10:31 AM
- Thanks, Jennifer!
- From Joshua Rudy Ochoa to Everyone 10:32 AM
- I'll have to head out a bit early for a personal appointment, but thanks y'all! Great presentations!
- From Jerry Shapiro, guest to Everyone 10:33 AM

- Hey is my question for Sophie and Everyone:
- Graduatee enrollment: Why not expand capacity where data indicates there is increased demand?
- From Jennifer Summit to Everyone 10:35 AM
- The answer varies by department, Jerry, because the costs and capacity vary greatly.
- From Michael Scott to Everyone 10:36 AM
- Dept of Ed is allowing no-cost extensions of HEERF III funding under certain circumstances. We routinely extend grants when allowed.
- From Member Michael Goldman to Everyone 10:37 AM
- Thanks AVP Jay!!
- From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) to Everyone 10:37 AM
- Thanks, Jay, for the great work on HEERF!
- From Jerry Shapiro, guest to Everyone 10:37 AM
- Thanks, Jennifer....At next UBC meeting it would be helpful to to have specific figures of the University
- From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone 10:37 AM
- @Micheal Scott, is there a place where we can see which programs are granted extensions? Or how do we find out about that?
- From Jerry Shapiro, guest to Everyone 10:39 AM
- Expense' per undergrad and graduate student
- From Michael Scott to Everyone 10:39 AM
- Data on extensions isn't normally readily available. We would be extending the end date of the entire grant NOT specifically on campus programs.
- From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone 10:39 AM
- @Michael, thank you.
- From Jeff Wilson to Everyone 10:45 AM
- Jennifer will be our final speaker for this agenda items. Open forum will start immediately afterward.
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 10:50 AM
- It looked like that committee already existed in the org chart
- From Sandee Noda_non voting member to Everyone 10:51 AM
- I did ask via email about putting a represented/rank and file person on the committee prior to the meeting
- From Member, Nancy Gerber to Everyone 10:51 AM
- Maybe use a dotted line for those committees that don't exist currently or are inactive.
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 10:52 AM
- I offer, again, my assistance with this.....
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 10:53 AM
- My point EXACTLY!
- From Guest - Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Admin Analyst/Specialist) to Everyone 10:54 AM
- It is great to have goals and big picture ideas but it is important to have representation from all areas of staffing that serve student needs.
- From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone 10:54 AM
- @Jennifer, excellent point
- From Member Darlene Yee-Melichar to Everyone 10:56 AM
- Technology Governance Committee information was very useful-- thanks to Nish, Shawn, and Andrew for the team report.
- From Maggie O'Brien to Everyone 10:59 AM
- Thank you for the great presentations and information.
- From Guest - Gabriela Segovia-McGahan (Admin Analyst/Specialist) to Everyone 11:00 AM
- Thanks, again, for the presentations! I have to go.
- From Member Genie Stowers (she/her) to Everyone 11:04 AM
- thanks for the great reports and data!

- From Mari Hulick (she/her) to Everyone 11:04 AM
- Thank you
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 11:04 AM
- Thank you everyone!
- From Rebecca Sanchez to Everyone 11:04 AM
- Thank You!
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 11:04 AM
- See you at the UBC Office Hours tomorrow!
- From Guest - Janet Remolona to Everyone 11:04 AM
- Thank you, all.
- From Member, Dylan Mooney to Everyone 11:05 AM
- Bye!